



Report of the Departmental Committee on the Employment of Prisoners

PART I EMPLOYMENT OF PRISONERS

*Presented by the Secretary of State for Home Affairs
to Parliament by Command of His Majesty,
November, 1933*

CH LONDON
PRINTED AND PUBLISHED BY HIS MAJESTY'S STATIONERY OFFICE
To be purchased directly from H.M. STATIONERY OFFICE at the following addresses
Adastral House, Kingsway, London, W.C.2; 120, George Street, Edinburgh 2
York Street, Manchester 1; 1, St. Andrew's Crescent, Cardiff
15, Donegall Square West, Belfast
or through any Bookseller

1933

Price 1s. 6d. Net

Cmd. 4462

ND	851.	ND
	THE CHARLES MYERS LIBRARY	
	Reference Section	
	NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF INDUSTRIAL PSYCHOLOGY	
ND		ND



22500434027

Med
K22426

NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF INDUSTRIAL PROPERTY

851.
SKJ



Report of the Departmental Committee on the Employment of Prisoners

PART I EMPLOYMENT OF PRISONERS

*Presented by the Secretary of State for Home Affairs
to Parliament by Command of His Majesty,
November, 1933*

G.B. HOME OFFICE

LONDON

PRINTED AND PUBLISHED BY HIS MAJESTY'S STATIONERY OFFICE

To be purchased directly from H.M. STATIONERY OFFICE at the following addresses
Adastral House, Kingsway, London, W.C.2; 120, George Street, Edinburgh 2
York Street, Manchester 1; 1, St. Andrew's Crescent, Cardiff
15, Donegall Square West, Belfast
or through any Bookseller

1933

Price 1s. 6d. Net

Cmd. 4462

25 918 313

Journal of the
Transactions of the
Royal Society of
Medicine
LONDON
PART I
JANUARY 1913

SKJ

WELLCOME INSTITUTE LIBRARY	
Coll.	weIMOmec
Call	
No.	WA

COPIES OF THE WARRANTS OF APPOINTMENT

I HEREBY APPOINT :

*Major Isidore Salmon, C.B.E., D.L., J.P., M.P.,
 Mr. C. E. Bartholomew, O.B.E.,
 Mr. W. C. Crook,
 Miss Margery Fry, J.P., LL.D.,
 Mr. A. Hollins, J.P.,
 Mr. J. J. Maxwell,
 †Mr. H. R. Scott, and
 Mr. A. E. Watson, C.B.E.,

to be a Committee to review the methods of employing prisoners and of assisting them to find employment on discharge, and to report what improvements are desirable and practicable.

AND I FURTHER APPOINT Major Isidore Salmon to be Chairman, and Mr. F. D. Forster, of the Prison Commission, to be Secretary of the Committee,

(Signed) HERBERT SAMUEL.

27th September, 1932.

It was subsequently decided to extend the terms of reference of the Committee to include Scotland as well as England and Wales, and by agreement with the Secretary of State for Scotland two Scottish members were added to the Committee by the following supplementary warrant of appointment.

I HEREBY APPOINT :

Mr. James Scott, J.P., and
 Mr. G. H. Clark,

to be additional members of the Committee appointed by my predecessor to review the methods of employing prisoners and of assisting them to find employment on discharge, and to report what improvements are desirable and practicable.

(Signed) JOHN GILMOUR.

13th October, 1932.

* Now Sir Isidore Salmon, C.B.E., D.L., J.P., M.P.

† Now Mr. H. R. Scott, C.B.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
INTRODUCTION	1
CHAPTER I.—Historical	1
II.—The Nature and Distribution of the Prison Population	8
III.—How Prisoners are now Employed	16
IV.—How Work is Organized	26
V.—The Value of Prison Labour	35
VI.—The Borstal Institutions	42
VII.—Observations on the Present Conditions of Employment in Prisons and Recommendations	53
SUMMARY OF CONCLUSIONS	87
APPENDIX I	89
„ II	90

NOTE.—The estimated cost of the preparation of the Report (Part I) is £790 14s. 3d. The cost of printing and publishing is estimated at £90.

DEPARTMENTAL COMMITTEE ON THE EMPLOYMENT OF PRISONERS

REPORT

To Lieut.-Col. the Right Hon. Sir JOHN GILMOUR, Bart.,
D.S.O., M.P., His Majesty's Secretary of State for the Home
Department.

SIR,

We, the undersigned members of the Committee appointed—

“to review the methods of employing prisoners and of assisting them to find employment on discharge, and to report what improvements are desirable and practicable”,

have the honour to submit our report on the matters falling within the first part of our terms of reference, viz., “the methods of employing prisoners”. We propose to deal with the second part, assistance to find employment on discharge, in a subsequent report.

We have held 37 meetings and have examined 34 witnesses. The names of these witnesses and of others who submitted written statements but did not give evidence are set out in Appendix I to our Report.

We have visited a number of prisons and Borstal Institutions in England and Scotland and have been given every facility for acquainting ourselves with the existing methods of employment.

To the officers of these establishments and to all who have assisted us by the submission of statements or by giving evidence we desire to express our thanks.

CHAPTER I.

HISTORICAL.

REPORT OF THE GLADSTONE COMMITTEE, 1895.

ENGLAND AND WALES.

2. The last general inquiry into English Prisons was conducted by a Departmental Committee appointed in 1894 by the late Earl of Oxford and Asquith (then Mr. H. H. Asquith, Home Secretary). One of the matters referred to the Committee was the subject of “prison labour and occupation with special reference to the moral and physical condition of the prisoners”.

The Committee remarked that the subject, although of intrinsic importance, had been passed over with but little notice in previous inquiries.

Convicts.

3. The Committee noted that for the first nine months of their sentence convicts were kept in isolated confinement, and for the first month were kept at first class hard labour and were subsequently engaged in oakum picking, mat-making, tailoring, or any work which it was found suitable to give them. After nine months all prisoners, unless physically disabled or found specially

qualified for other work, were put to associated labour in public works, quarrying, farming, land reclaiming and so forth. They made no recommendations as regards convicts only.

Prisoners.

4. The Committee recommended that unproductive labour, i.e., all purely mechanical work on cranks or treadwheels, and, in the case of women, oakum-picking, except as a punishment, should be abolished wherever possible.

At that time every prisoner of 16 years of age and upwards, sentenced to hard labour, was kept at hard labour of the First Class for six hours a day during his whole sentence, if it did not exceed three months, and for the first three months if it exceeded that period. During the remainder of his sentence he might be kept at First Class hard labour, unless the Commissioners substituted labour of the Second Class; and, after 1877, the Secretary of State could in either case substitute hard labour of the Second Class for the last two months. First Class hard labour was defined by the Prison Act, 1865, Section 19, as work at the treadwheel, shot drill, crank, capstan, stone-breaking, or such other hard bodily labour as might be determined by the Justices with the approval of the Secretary of State. The Committee found the general opinion to be against such labour and stated as the strongest argument against it the fact that it kept the prisoner in a state of mental vacuity.

The Committee admitted that no satisfactory alternative had been suggested, for as local prisons were for the most part situated in the heart of large towns, hard bodily labour was difficult and usually impossible to provide within the prison walls. They suggested changes in classification, which would remove from the large towns many of the younger prisoners, and the collection of habitual offenders in special prisons.

Associated labour.

5. The Committee had to consider a question which may now be regarded as settled, namely, the association of prisoners at industrial labour. They reported that they believed the advantages largely outweighed the disadvantages, provided that there was a proper system of supervision and classification. They referred to the admirable workshops at Wandsworth and recommended that similar shops should be provided in other prisons.

Lack of suitable work.

6. The Committee went on to say that difficulty of a greater or less extent had been experienced in almost every prison in getting a sufficiency of suitable work for the male prisoners, a difficulty largely added to by outside agitation against competition of prisoners with free labour. In consequence, some suitable industries, and in particular mat-making, had been to a large extent given up.

Their conclusion on the question of the employment of prisoners on work for sale outside is set out in a paragraph which is worth quotation :—

“ We communicated with Mr. S. Woods, the general secretary of the Parliamentary Committee of Trades Union Congress, and by his suggestion we examined Mr. J. J. Rudge and Mr. J. H. Walker as representing the views of the majority of trades unions. These gentlemen gave very fair and impartial evidence. They admitted that industrial labour was morally and physically beneficial to the prisoners, and agreed that it ought to be found. They urged that direct competition with outside labour should not be allowed at “ cutting ” prices. Taking their evidence as a whole we gather that they approve of industrial training of prisoners : and bearing in mind that the products of prison labour go to reduce the costs of prisons, they have no objection to the sale of prison goods provided that (a) they are not sold below the market price for the district or the standard price elsewhere ; (b) every consideration is shown to the special circumstances of particular industries outside to avoid all undue interference with the wages and employment of free labour. With these general views we agree.”

The Committee were of opinion that “ very considerable additions ” might be made to the orders given to prisons by Government Departments and they referred particularly to washing and printing.

Women prisoners.

7. The Committee noted that the staple occupations of women prisoners were laundry and other domestic work. The profit on outside work at Strangeways was said to amount to £1,000 a year. The Committee found the evidence in regard to laundry work showed the advantages of associated labour.

Work as training.

8. They found that male prisoners after discharge did not as a rule follow a trade learned in prison, and they took the view that “ training in orderly and industrial habits is of higher value than the teaching of a special trade.”

Work on land.

9. The Committee expressed regret that there was not more opportunity for work in gardens or on the land and recommended that the area within the prison walls should be used as far as possible for gardening purposes, and that in agricultural districts land adjoining prisons should be acquired for the purpose of labour.

Organization of industry.

10. The Committee recommended that the officer entrusted with the duty of supervising the industrial work both of convict and local

prisoners should have a higher degree of authority and responsibility. "After consultation with the Governors he would have to distribute work according to local requirements and the capacities of prisoners, and would make contracts with Government Departments, and be responsible for punctual delivery and an adequate standard of work."

The Committee suggested that, in order to develop prison labour, the pay of instructors should be improved so as to attract skilled teachers, and that an extra allowance should be granted to warders who acquired sufficient knowledge in prison to supervise skilled work.

They recommended the appointment in each prison of an official, holding a position similar to that of a "manufacturer" before 1878, who would have a recognized position as director of industries under the Governor, and they suggested that, at any rate in the smaller prisons, the Storekeepers might be made use of for this purpose.

Gratuities.

11. Finally, the Committee suggested that gratuities to prisoners should be increased. In local prisons the gratuity was at that time limited to 10s., which could be earned in six months. The Committee thought a prisoner should be able to earn something continuously during his sentence, provided the money was not all given to him on discharge, but was paid over subsequently through a Discharged Prisoners' Aid Society, or in such way as the Society or the Visiting Justices might determine.

Changes since 1895.

12. Following the Report of the Gladstone Committee the Prison Act of 1898 was passed, merging the offices of Directors of Convict Prisons and Commissioners of Prisons, and providing for the making of Rules for the Government of Local and Convict Prisons. This gave an elasticity which was not possible under the detailed Regulations in Schedule I of the Prison Act, 1865, and permitted of the far-reaching changes which have since taken place in our prisons.

Remission of Sentence.

13. The Act laid down that provision might be made by Prison Rules for enabling a prisoner sentenced to imprisonment to earn by special industry and good conduct remission of a portion of his imprisonment.* Under this provision a prisoner is now eligible for remission up to a maximum of one-sixth of his sentence. As a result of this arrangement and because experience showed that

* Ever since Penal Servitude was substituted for Transportation by the Penal Servitude Act of 1853 (16 & 17 Vict. Cap. 99) there has been a system of earlier release on licence for convicts. The period for which licences were granted varied until 1891 when the present maximum of one-quarter of the whole sentence for men and one-third for women was established.

gratuities were frequently misspent,* the suggestion of the Gladstone Committee for the extension of a system of gratuities was not carried out and, in fact, gratuities to individual prisoners were discontinued in 1913. Instead a capitation grant was made to Discharged Prisoners' Aid Societies to be expended in the interests of prisoners on their release.

Industrial changes.

14. The recommendations of the Committee for the abolition of unproductive labour and the development of work in association were acted upon and led to a complete transformation in the régime of the Local Prisons. The crank and treadwheel were abolished and oakum picking has almost entirely disappeared. In their places a large variety of industries has been introduced and workshops have been built for the accommodation of prisoners employed in association. Even during the last fifteen years considerable sums have been spent on the erection of the following new workshops, etc.

Bedford	New shop 60 feet by 32 feet.
Birmingham	New shop 230 feet by 32 feet. New store 90 feet by 32 feet.
Borstal	Fitters shop extended. New wood chopping shed. New timber store, and new general store.
Camp Hill	New shop 159 feet by 66 feet.
Cardiff	New shop 80 feet by 32 feet.
Chelmsford	New shop 137 feet by 46 feet.
Dorchester	New shop 50 feet by 24 feet.
Durham	New shop 150 feet by 32 feet.
Feltham	New shop 60 feet by 40 feet. New shop 80 feet by 32 feet. Timber store 75 feet by 25 feet.
Gloucester	New shop 80 feet by 27 feet.
Leeds	New shop 172 feet by 32 feet.
Leicester	Prison cell block converted into good shop.
Lincoln	Addition to shop, measuring 30 feet by 30 feet.
Maidstone	New shop for Carpenters.
Manchester	New shop 219 feet by 29 feet. Two shops 75 feet by 38 feet.
Nottingham	Shop extended by 20 feet.
Oxford	New shop 76 feet by 25 feet.
Preston	New shop 90 feet by 32 feet.
Swansea	New shop 60 feet by 32 feet.
Wandsworth	New store 90 feet by 50 feet. New shop 120 feet by 30 feet.
Winchester	New shop 50 feet by 32 feet.

* cf. p. 32 § 79 of the Report of the Persistent Offenders Committee.

Provision was made in the 1933-34 estimates for building additional shops at Chelmsford, Exeter, Pentonville, Wakefield, Dorchester and Birmingham.

The existing position in regard to workshop accommodation is set out in paragraphs 46 and 99.

For the supervision of the work in these shops a new grade of Officer Instructor has been established and a system of allowances to Instructors set up. Some of these Instructors have learned their trade in outside shops before entering the Prison Service; some are tradesmen who are brought in as unestablished officers; while others have gained their knowledge of a trade within the prison shops.

Borstal Institutions.

15. A further recommendation of the Committee, for the establishment of a penal reformatory for offenders under the age of 23, found eventual expression, with some modifications, in the Prevention of Crime Act, 1908, under which the Borstal Institutions were established. The Act gave power to pass sentences of Borstal Detention on offenders between the ages of 16 and 21, and increasing use has been made of this provision until, at the present time, there are seven Borstal Institutions with a population of just over 2,000 persons. The segregation of these young offenders has made possible a development of the idea of vocational training which was not practicable in the ordinary prison, and to this we shall refer in greater detail later on.

Preventive Detention.

16. The Act of 1908 also authorized the institution of a system of Preventive Detention for habitual criminals, but the new form of sentence has been little used by the Courts and the number of men now in custody is only about 110. They occupy the prison at Portsmouth while there are only three women, who are in the prison at Aylesbury.

Educational changes etc.

17 These changes in the employment and treatment of prisoners have been accompanied in recent years by a remarkable development in the educational and social work of the prisons.

During 1932, 340 different classes were held by voluntary teachers in prisons (not including Borstal Institutions) and during the year 15,298 prisoners passed through the classes. A return, obtained in May, 1933, showed that there were in that month classes attended by 2,982 prisoners, some of whom were attending more than one class.

In addition to classes, there is at every prison a programme of lectures and concerts which are attended by a large number of selected prisoners. These activities, together with the general introduction of periods of physical training for all prisoners who are able to benefit by it, have provided the modern prisoner with

occupation for an appreciable part of the day outside his cell. The reduction of the period of separate confinement, formerly enforced in the case of penal servitude prisoners, to 3 months in 1911, and its final abolition in 1922 marked a further move in the same direction.

Period of associated labour.

18. With few exceptions all prisoners now work for a proportion of the day outside their cells, either in the shops, or in and about the prison buildings and grounds.

The object of the Commissioners, as expressed in the Rules, is that, so far as practicable, every prisoner shall work for 8 hours a day in associated labour; and in practice something approaching this had been achieved by 1931. As a consequence of the financial crisis reductions were made in the prison staffs, with the result that, except in the Borstal Institutions and certain specialized prisons such as Wakefield, prisoners are only out of their cells for purposes of associated labour for approximately $6\frac{1}{2}$ hours a day. As we explain later in our Report, the time of actual work is for various reasons still further reduced by rather more than $1\frac{1}{2}$ hours a day.

Lack of work.

19. As regards the actual amount of work performed by prisoners, it appears that before the War there was an adequate supply of suitable work and that tasks were in general strictly enforced. During the years 1914-18 the prisoners were largely employed on work that was needed for war purposes, and under the stimulus of patriotic feeling and an extra ration of food, they worked well and effectively. The post-war period saw a change for the worse. Orders fell off seriously after 1919, partly because of surplus stocks in the hands of Government Departments, partly because of reductions in the strength of the defence forces, and partly because of the change over from coal to oil in the Navy, which led to a great reduction in the demands for coal sacks and baskets. In consequence it became a difficult matter to find sufficient work. The introduction of machinery into the prisons, together with changed methods and articles of manufacture, rendered the old scales of tasks out of date; and in the absence of a regular and sufficient flow of orders insistence on a high level of output ceased to be regarded as a matter of first importance, and new scales were not introduced. The attitude both of officers and prisoners towards employment was influenced by this state of affairs and it has been difficult to counteract this and to recover or improve upon the old position.

SCOTLAND.

20. Although the Gladstone Committee's recommendations were made with reference to Prisons in England and Wales only, we have found in the course of our enquiry that prison administration

in Scotland has developed along lines similar to those followed in England, and that, so far as the matters under reference are concerned, conditions in Scottish Prisons are comparable with those in the Prisons in England and Wales. The reduction in the hours of associated labour referred to above did not apply to Scotland, where an actual $7\frac{1}{2}$ hour day continues in operation.

CHAPTER II.

THE NATURE AND DISTRIBUTION OF THE PRISON POPULATION.

21. The problem which we have to consider is the provision of suitable employment for all fit persons in a daily average population which has remained since December, 1932, round about 13,000, distributed over 31* prisons and 7 Borstal Institutions in England and Wales, and some 1,600 prisoners in 11* Scottish prisons and 2 Borstal Institutions.

ENGLAND AND WALES.

22. In 1932 the daily average prison population in England and Wales was made up as follows:—

	<i>Male.</i>	<i>Female.</i>	<i>Total.</i>
Unconvicted prisoners :			
(1) Trial and Remand	731	68	799
(2) Debtors (see para. 24) ...	876	12	888
(3) Miscellaneous	13	—	13
Prisoners serving sentences of Imprisonment (up to 2 years)	6,735	553	7,288
Young Prisoners awaiting sentence ...	31	1	32
Other convicted prisoners	10	1	11
Convicts serving sentences of Penal Servitude (3 years or more)	1,512	58	1,570
Convicts serving sentences of Preventive Detention (following a sentence of Penal Servitude)	111	3	114
Persons serving sentences of Borstal Detention (up to 3 years)	1,973	115	2,088
Total	11,992	811	12,803

We shall deal separately with the Borstal Institutions, and matters connected therewith are generally excluded from consideration in the following paragraphs of this Chapter.

* There are certain Borstal inmates in 2 English and 2 Scottish prisons (see paragraphs 92 and 112).

CLASSIFICATION.

Statutory Classes.*(a) Prisoners.*

23. Under the Prison Acts certain classes of prisoners are required to be kept separate from other classes, viz. :—

Trial and Remand Prisoners.

Section 39 of the Prisons Act, 1877, directs that there shall be special rules for the treatment of trial and remand prisoners, because “ it is expedient that a clear difference shall be made between the treatment of persons unconvicted of crime and in law presumably innocent during the period of their detention in prison for safe custody only, and the treatment of prisoners who have been convicted of crime ”.

(Incidentally it may be mentioned that this classification is imperfect, since many of the prisoners awaiting trial are old offenders who have been in prison before—perhaps on numerous occasions—and it is difficult in the smaller prisons to keep them apart from other trial or remand prisoners.)

Debtor Prisoners.

24. Any persons committed by civil process for failure to comply with orders for payment of monies, whether made by the County Courts or by Courts of Summary Jurisdiction, in respect of Wife Maintenance or Affiliation Orders, default in payment of rates or Income Tax are classed as Debtors and treated under special Rules.

Section 6 (3) of the Prison Act, 1898, provides that debtor prisoners shall not be associated with criminal prisoners.

(This provision also leads to some anomalies, since it means that a man who is in prison for failing to pay a fine for, say, a motoring offence, or for a breach of some Police Regulation, and who is therefore technically a criminal prisoner, must be kept apart from a man who is in prison for failing to pay under a wife maintenance or a bastardy order.)

First Division Prisoners.

25. On an average there are only one or two First Division sentences in a year. They may, therefore, be disregarded for purposes of employment.

Second Division Prisoners.

Section 6 (2) of the Prison Act, 1898, empowers Courts to place an offender in the Second Division if “ having regard to the nature of the offence and antecedents of the offender ” the Court desires to separate him from the prisoners who are of criminal or depraved habits.

Third Division Prisoners.

If a prisoner is sentenced to hard labour, or if he is sentenced to imprisonment without any direction by a Court for Second Division treatment, he falls into the Third Division.

There is, in fact, no difference in the treatment of an ordinary and a hard labour prisoner, except that the latter is allowed no mattress for the first 14 days of his sentence.

(b) *Convicts, i.e., persons sentenced to Penal Servitude or Preventive Detention.*

Classes instituted by the Prison Commissioners.

26. In addition to divisions imposed by the law the Prison Commissioners have instituted other classes. This they have done because they attach great importance to the general principle that prisoners who are not depraved or confirmed in criminal habits should not work side by side with those by whom they are likely to be contaminated.

The classes are as follows :—

27.—(a) *Prisoners, i.e., persons sentenced to terms of imprisonment.*

1. *Star Class.*—Courts frequently fail to order Second Division treatment for offenders who have no criminal antecedents and ought to be kept apart from the prisoner of criminal habits. To remedy these omissions the Prison Commissioners have instituted the “Star” Class in which are placed those prisoners for whom the Courts might have ordered, but have omitted to order, Second Division treatment. Star Class prisoners are treated on the same footing as Second Division prisoners, and are associated with them, so that for the purposes of employment the Second Division and the Star Class may be treated as one class.

2. *Special Class.*—The Prison Commissioners have instituted the “Special” Class for young criminals between 21 and 26 years of age who have previous convictions. These men are both more troublesome and more hopeful subjects than the older people who have settled down to criminal habits and have become inured to prison treatment; and it is thought desirable to keep these younger men apart from the others in order to give them the treatment more appropriate to their age and to lessen the chances of their falling into step with the older and more confirmed offenders.

3. *Young Prisoners.*—There are still many young people between 16 and 21 who are sentenced—not to Borstal Detention—but to imprisonment. So far as practicable these young people are kept apart from other prisoners.

4. *Ordinary Class*.—The prisoners who do not fall into any of the special classes mentioned above are styled the “ Ordinary Class.”

28.—(b) *Convicts, i.e., persons sentenced to Penal Servitude or Preventive Detention.*

1. *Star Class*, i.e., persons who have not been previously convicted or are not of criminal habits but have committed a serious crime for which a sentence of penal servitude is imposed.

2. *Special Class*, i.e., young men of criminal habits between the ages of 21 and 30 who are serving a first sentence of penal servitude and are not of poor physique or mentality.

3. *Ordinary Class*, i.e., persons unsuitable for the Star or the Special Class.

29. The daily average numbers in the various classes during 1932 were as follows :—

Unconvicted Prisoners :

	<i>Males.</i>	<i>Females.</i>	<i>Total.</i>
Remands and Trials	731	68	799
Debtors	876	12	888
Miscellaneous	13	—	13
	<hr/>	<hr/>	<hr/>
	1,620	80	1,700
	<hr/>	<hr/>	<hr/>

Convicted Prisoners :

	<i>Males.</i>	<i>Females.</i>	<i>Total.</i>
2nd Division	427	58	485
Star Class	1,386	48	1,434
Special Class	874	13	887
Young Prisoner Class	430	28	458
Ordinary Class	3,649	407	4,056
Miscellaneous	10	1	11
	<hr/>	<hr/>	<hr/>
	6,776	555	7,331
	<hr/>	<hr/>	<hr/>

Convicts :

	<i>Males.</i>	<i>Females.</i>	<i>Total.</i>
Penal Servitude, all classes	1,512	58	1,570
Preventive Detention ...	111	3	114

30. Classification complicates the problem of prison employment since prisoners of certain categories must not be grouped together in the same working parties.

In practice, however, the necessity of getting some special work done, or the desirability of employing some prisoner on work for which he is specially fitted, lead to some exceptions from the principles of classification.

The Prisons.

31. In addition to this classification by individuals the Prison Commissioners have developed to an increasing extent the policy of allocating certain types of prisoners to certain prisons.

The distinction between convict and local prisons dates from the substitution of penal servitude for transportation, and until recently all convicts served the major part of their sentences in convict prisons.

For reasons which are set out in 'the Report of the Commissioners for 1931, this separation has now been partially abandoned, and a number of convicts serving sentences of three years' penal servitude are now retained in local prisons where they associate with the corresponding classes of local prisoners.

Distribution of Prisoners.

32. The distribution of the prison population is now as follows :—

In London, where there are 5 prisons, arrangements have been made to set aside different prisons for different types of prisoner. Brixton takes the trial and remand prisoners and those committed by civil process; Wormwood Scrubs takes the young prisoners (i.e., those between 16 and 21) and adults who have not been in prison before; Pentonville and Wandsworth take the recidivists; and Holloway takes women not only from London but also from a wide surrounding area from Norfolk to Wiltshire.

Outside London there are 20 general Prisons which, subject to the special arrangements mentioned below, receive persons of all types committed by the Courts in the area which each prison serves. The persons received in the prisons include (a) those committed on remand or for trial; (b) those committed by civil process for failure to comply with orders for the payment of monies, e.g., Wife Maintenance Orders, Affiliation Orders and County Court Judgment Orders; (c) those convicted of offences and either sent to prison in default of payment of fines or sentenced to imprisonment without the option of a fine. There are also confined in these local prisons a number of convicts sentenced to penal servitude for terms not exceeding three years.

33. In addition to these general prisons there are certain special establishments to which are transferred selected classes of prisoners.

Maidstone and Wakefield Prisons receive convicts of the "Star" Class.

Wakefield Prison is also used as a special training establishment for persons sentenced to imprisonment for six months or more who by reason of age or character appear to be suitable subjects for more positive training than is practicable in a general prison. The arrangement is that the Governors of the Northern and Midland prisons pick out, from among the men sentenced to imprisonment for 6 months or more, those who are not confirmed in their criminal habits and are not mental or physical weaklings and transfer them to Wakefield.

Dartmoor and Parkhurst convict prisons receive convicts of the Ordinary Class.

A number of Star convicts is retained at Parkhurst on medical grounds.

Chelmsford Prison has been set aside as a special establishment for young men of criminal habits between the ages of 21 and 30 who (a) are serving a first sentence of penal servitude or (b) have been sentenced to a prolonged term of imprisonment.

Portsmouth Prison has lately been opened as a special establishment for the men (about 110 in number) serving sentences of Preventive Detention.

The seven women's prisons in the provinces are not separate prisons but separate blocks or wings of the local prisons.

In a separate block of the establishment at Aylesbury there are a few women convicts of the "Star" Class and a few women serving sentences of Preventive Detention.

The rest of the women convicts are at Holloway.

Collecting Centres.

34. In order to make better arrangements for the treatment of Young Prisoners (i.e., those under 21) parts of certain prisons, viz., Bedford, Bristol, Durham, Liverpool, Winchester and Wormwood Scrubs have been set aside as "Collecting Centres" for young prisoners serving sentences of over three months.

For similar reasons parts of certain prisons, viz., Birmingham, Lincoln, Liverpool, Wandsworth, and Holloway (women only) have been allocated as collecting centres for weak-minded prisoners, i.e., prisoners who are not certifiable as insane or mentally defective, but nevertheless require special treatment because of their mental condition.

Sentences.

35. The sentences which prisoners are serving vary from a few days to life.

In 1932 the distribution of sentences in the average daily population was as follows:—

Convicts, i.e.,	Male.	Female.	Total.
prisoners serving sentences of 3 or more years Penal Servitude	1,512	58	1,570
or sentences of Preventive Detention	111	3	114
Prisoners,			
Under 3 months	1,342	195	1,537
3 months and less than 6 months	1,283	116	1,399
6 months and less than 12 months	1,984	145	2,129
12 months and over	2,126	97	2,223
Young Prisoners awaiting sentence	31	1	32
Other convicted prisoners ...	10	1	11
Total ...	8,399	616	9,015

A male convict can by good conduct earn release on licence after serving three-quarters of his sentence, a woman convict after serving two-thirds. A prisoner (male or female) can earn remission of one sixth of the sentence and be released unconditionally.

It will be seen that 5,065 prisoners were serving sentences of less than 12 months, so that allowing for remission, over two-thirds of the local prisoners were in prison for less than ten months.

Previous occupation &c. of prisoners.

36. Figures published in Appendix No. 8 (Table V) to the Report of the Prison Commissioners for 1931 show that, of receptions into prison of convicted prisoners, the percentage of skilled work-people was just over 29; that approximately 50 per cent. were labourers &c.; 6.6 per cent. were vagrants, prostitutes, and others of known bad character; 4.5 per cent. were shop assistants, clerks, waiters &c.; and 4.0 per cent. were domestic servants. These figures are based on the statements of prisoners which are often made for interested reasons. They must therefore be accepted with reserve.

The figures for Scotland are unskilled workers 63.9 per cent.; skilled workers 16 per cent.

Many of them, especially among the younger prisoners, have never been in regular employment but no figures are available as to this or as to the number actually in employment at the time of conviction.

37. As regards the quality of the human material which passes through the prisons, we may quote Dr. W. Norwood East, H.M. Medical Commissioner: "Many prisoners purposely avoid hard work and have lost permanently the capacity for sustained effort, others are untrained or cannot be trusted to work with machines or tools. Thirty-seven per cent. of the male admissions in 1930 were 40 years of age or over. Some are of poor physique, indifferent mental capacity or temperamentally unstable. In short the human material in prison differs considerably from that in the general labour market. It is seldom efficient, it is often indifferent, and is sometimes useless. No doubt many of the first offenders—30 per cent. of the admissions in 1930—would be retained by a private employer working for profit. Only few recidivists would escape dismissal if staffs were being reduced."

Speaking of a special review made in the winter of 1932-33, Dr. East said:

"Of 17,666 recent admissions to prison of all classes of male prisoners (convicted, debtors and trials), 13,085 were passed medically fit for First Class Labour (74 per cent.), 2,933 for Second Class Labour (17 per cent.), 1,134 for Light Labour (6 per cent.), and 514 (3 per cent.) were unfit for any form of labour on reception.

“ It does not follow that a man passed fit for first class labour in prison is equally fit for hard manual labour in the outside world. Of 9,380 male prisoners in custody on 5th January, 1933, 6,467 (69 per cent.) were fit for any form of hard labour in the general market, 1,665 (18 per cent.) were fit for labour intermediate to hard manual labour and light labour, 1,031 (11 per cent.) were fit for light labour, and 217 (2 per cent.) were unfit for any labour.”

SCOTLAND.

38. The daily average population in Prisons and Penal Institutions in Scotland in 1932 is given below. The figures do not include untried prisoners, who are not obliged to work.

	<i>Male.</i>	<i>Female.</i>	<i>Total.</i>
Civil Prisoners (the average daily number is less than 1)	—	—	—
Ordinary Prisoners (including Juvenile Adults)	1,068	127	1,195
Convicts (including Star Class) ...	126	4	130
Preventive Detention Prisoners ...	2	—	2
Borstal Inmates (including those whose licences have been revoked)	256	14	270
	<hr/> 1,452	<hr/> 145	<hr/> 1,597

CLASSIFICATION.

39. In Scotland, with a total prison population of some 1,600, the Prisons Department cannot segregate special classes of prisoners to any great extent.

Statutory Classes.

(a) *Prisoners.*

Untried Prisoners.

These correspond with the Trial and Remand Prisoners in England. They are kept apart from convicted prisoners and special rules govern their treatment.

Civil Prisoners.

Civil Prisoners in Scotland are akin to Debtor Prisoners in England and are accorded treatment on similar lines.

Ordinary Prisoners.

Ordinary prisoners, i.e., those not included in any of the classes specifically mentioned are sent to the Prison serving the area in which they were sentenced.

(b) *Convicts, i.e., persons sentenced to Penal Servitude or Preventive Detention.*

Generally speaking, all male convicts are sent to a prison set apart for convicts. There is no establishment specially appropriated for the treatment of women convicts, but they are, as far as possible, kept apart from other prisoners.

The number of Preventive Detention prisoners in Scotland is so small that this class may be disregarded in our Report.

Classes instituted by the Prison Authorities.

Juvenile Adults.

40. Young persons between the ages of 16 and 21 are still received in fairly large numbers under sentences of ordinary imprisonment. In the Prisons of Edinburgh and Barlinnie, Glasgow, male prisoners of this type are kept apart from other prisoners. They are known as Juvenile Adults.

Star Class Convicts.

Convicts against whom no previous conviction is known, and who are otherwise suitable, are treated as a special class, known as the Star Class. They are housed in the same establishment as other convicts, but are kept separate from them as far as possible.

41. There are 11 prisons in Scotland (including one at Kirkwall in the Orkneys, and one at Lerwick in the Shetlands, which are frequently empty). Of the others, those at Aberdeen, Dumfries Inverness and Perth are local prisons for the reception of male and female prisoners of the ordinary class. Edinburgh Prison receives ordinary prisoners of both sexes and has, in addition, a Juvenile Adult Section. Barlinnie Prison, Glasgow, reserved for males, receives ordinary prisoners and has a Juvenile Adult Section. Duke Street Prison, Glasgow, receives female prisoners and convicts. Greenock Prison receives male prisoners. Peterhead Prison is the only convict prison in Scotland. Generally speaking, all male convicts, including those whose licences have been revoked or forfeited, are sent to Peterhead, and those whose Penal Servitude sentence is to be followed by one of Preventive Detention remain at Peterhead to serve the latter sentence.

CHAPTER III.

HOW PRISONERS ARE NOW EMPLOYED.

ENGLAND AND WALES.

42. The prisoners' working day of 10 hours is divided into two parts—

(a) that spent in associated or other employment outside his cell,

(b) that spent in employment in his cell.

To the relative lengths of these two forms of occupation we refer in paragraphs 74 and 75.

With the exception of prisoners in the First Division and prisoners on remand or awaiting trial all prisoners who are physically and mentally fit to do so are required to work.

Trial and remand prisoners are not required to work but if they do so and their work is satisfactory they are paid after the first week at the rate of 6d. a day or 3s. a week.

Aims of the Prison Commissioners.

43. As regards the majority of prisoners, the aim of the Prison Commissioners has been to provide employment which will keep them usefully employed, prevent deterioration, and as far as possible contribute to the cost of their maintenance and supervision. They make no claim that a prisoner is taught a trade that he can follow on release, as they have reached the conclusion that the poor quality of the labour, the conditions of an institutional life and the shortness of a large proportion of the sentences make this impossible for all but a minority of prisoners.

In the case of the minority, who are sufficiently young and who are serving sufficiently long sentences, the Prison Commissioners have endeavoured to organize a system of training which, even though it does not in most cases amount to a definite vocational training, will inculcate habits of industry and so render the prisoner better fitted to take up whatever kind of work may be available on discharge.

44. At Wakefield selected prisoners are employed in a variety of industries, including the weaving by power of almost every variety of fabric in use in the Prison Service, mat-making, moulding and metal work, carpentry, twine-making and gardening. Recently, as an experiment, the Prison Commissioners have leased an area of 67 acres of woodland some 7 miles from Wakefield to which 40 selected prisoners are conveyed daily by motor lorry. They are engaged in clearing the land with a view to eventual cultivation.

At Chelmsford the Commissioners have collected some 180 young prisoners of criminal habits, with a view to a more strenuous régime than is possible in a general prison. Tinsmithing and building are the principal industries, while a considerable area of land will be available for cultivation when it has been enclosed.

At Wormwood Scrubs and Maidstone the limitation of the population to "Stars" has made possible the granting of a greater measure of liberty and association than is possible in a general prison, and this has facilitated the development of industries in these prisons.

Kinds of Employment.

45. Practically the whole of the work done in the prisons of England and Wales is for the Prison Service or for other Government Departments, and with the exception of farm and gardening work at those prisons which possess land, reclamation work in Parkhurst Forest, building work on quarters for prison officers and the clearing work at Wakefield already referred to, it is all carried on within the prison walls.

The distribution of prisoners working time between the various occupations during the years 1924-29 was as follows :—

	<i>Per cent.</i>	<i>Per cent.</i>
Manufactures :—		
(a) Mailbags	27.4	} 60.5
(b) Other industries	33.1	
Domestic Services		16.5
Building work		10.5
Farm work		1.5
Non effective (sick awaiting trial &c.)		11.0
		<hr/> 100.0 <hr/>

Manufactures.

46. It will be seen that the main occupation is “ manufactures ”, which includes work in shops, in yards and in cells, but the above figures do not show what proportion of the daily population is employed in the workshops. Returns, obtained at our request show that at all prisons, excluding Borstal Institutions, there are now 94 shops with a total accommodation of 6,147, and that on the 11th May, 1933, the total number of prisoners employed in these shops was 4,777, or 42.9 per cent. of the total population of these establishments.

The numbers of prisoners employed in the shops on the main industries were as follows :—

<i>Industry.</i>	<i>All Prisons (excluding Borstal Institutions)</i>	<i>Prisoners employed.</i>
Mailbagmaking and kindred trades	1,336	
Basketmaking	92	
Brushmaking	197	
Carpentry	240	
Needleworkers	221	
Tailoring	620	
Shoemaking	339	
Matmaking	320	
Ships fenders	135	
Printing	70	
Fitting, Smithing and Foundry	153	
Tinsmithing	113	
Weaving	300	
Sackmaking and Sailmaking	100	

The distribution and equipment of workshops are very uneven. Whereas at some prisons the majority of prisoners are regularly employed on industrial labour and considerable use is made of

machinery, at others the workshop accommodation is small compared to the population, there is no machinery and all work is done by hand. The fluctuations of the committals and sentences in different areas, the requirements of the system of classification, and, since the War, the falling off of orders have made it difficult always to utilize to the full such accommodation as exists; while the numerous changes which, in the interests of reformative treatment or of economy, have in recent years been made in the distribution of prisoners between the various establishments have made difficult a satisfactory organization of prison industries from the purely industrial point of view.

47. In addition to the work done in the shops or in outside parties prisoners are usually required to perform each day a prescribed amount of work in their cells. This consists mainly in the sewing of mailbags, but other cell tasks issued from time to time include Tailoring, Needlework, Coal Sacks, Hammocks and, to a very limited extent, Picking of oakum, cotton, &c.

The reduction in the orders for mailbags to which we refer in paragraph 83 has made the problem of providing suitable cell work specially difficult.

48. The trades at present carried on at the various prisons are as follows :—

Baking	All establishments except Holloway Prison.
Basketmaking	Lewes, Pentonville and Winchester.
Bookbinding	Maidstone and Pentonville. Repairing of library books carried out at a number of prisons.
Brush and Mopmaking	Wandsworth and Wormwood Scrubs.
Carpentry	Wormwood Scrubs, Durham, Bristol, Wandsworth, Liverpool, Bedford, Dartmoor, Parkhurst, Maidstone.
Dressmaking	Holloway, Liverpool, Manchester.
Glovemaking	Exeter.
Knitting and Repairs	All establishments.
Mailbagmaking and Repairs.	All establishments.
Matmaking, Coir	Birmingham, Wakefield, Durham, Norwich. Occasionally at Bristol and Swansea.
Matmaking, Rope	Pentonville, Bristol, Swansea, Wandsworth.

Mattressmaking	All establishments. At most places it is the re-making of bedding used in prisons, etc. Wakefield.
Moulding	All establishments.
Needlework and Repairs...	Liverpool, Parkhurst, Durham.
Netmaking	Winchester, Pentonville.
Nosebagmaking	A daily average of about 40 prisoners, who are unfit for other employment, is engaged on this work at sundry prisons. Owing to shortage of mailbag work it has recently been found necessary to increase this form of employment.
Oakum and other Picking	(Postmen's letter bags and satchels), Wandsworth.
Pouchmaking	Maidstone, Pentonville.
Printing	(Coal bags, coal sacks, hammocks, cartridge and projectile bags, seamen's kit bags, soldiers' kit bags, signal cones, nettles, clews and lanyards). Wandsworth, Leeds, Manchester, Pentonville.
Sackmaking and Sail-making.	Bristol, Durham, Pentonville, Parkhurst.
Ship and Boat Fender-making.	Wormwood Scrubs, Pentonville, Wandsworth, Bedford, Dartmoor, Parkhurst. Repairs are carried out at all establishments.
Boot and Shoemaking ...	(Cash bags, tool bags, leggings, pouches, frogs, straps, etc.). Wandsworth, Pentonville and Wormwood Scrubs.
Leather Work	Maidstone, Chelmsford, Dartmoor, Durham, Wandsworth.
Smithing and Fitting ...	Wandsworth, Wormwood Scrubs, Pentonville, Dartmoor, Parkhurst, Wakefield, Liverpool, Birmingham, Lincoln, Maidstone, Manchester. Repairs carried out at all establishments.
Tailoring	

Twine and Rope Making	Wakefield, Liverpool, Winchester, Durham.
Weaving, Cotton and Linen.	Manchester, Liverpool, Wakefield, Cardiff, Exeter.
Woollen	Wakefield, Leeds.
Matting	Birmingham.
Rugs (Loom)	Wakefield, Manchester, Swansea.
Rugs (Frame)	Oxford, Bristol, Wakefield, Parkhurst, Lewes, Exeter.
Sword Matting	Shrewsbury.
Wood chopping	Wandsworth, Wormwood Scrubs, Pentonville, Leicester, Winchester, Wakefield, Dorchester, and sundry other prisons.
Domestic Work, Gardening, etc.	Cleaners, jobbers, labourers, cooks, gardeners, orderlies, stokers, and washers.
	All establishments.
Farming	Dartmoor, Parkhurst.
Land Reclamation	Wakefield.

Sources of Work.

49. Notwithstanding the evidence of the Trades Union representatives, given before the Gladstone Committee in 1895, that, subject to certain conditions (see paragraph 6), there was no objection to the undertaking of work for outside persons or firms, the Commissioners have not thought it expedient to undertake more than a very small amount of such work.

50. During the seven years 1925-31, the average annual sales of prison goods were approximately as follows:—

					<i>Receipts.</i>	<i>Percentages.</i>
					£	
Admiralty	30,580	15.75
War Office	7,242	3.73
Air Ministry	4,893	2.52
Office of Works	6,193	3.19
General Post Office	132,318	68.15
Other Government Departments	5,922	3.05
Discharged Prisoners' Aid Societies	252	0.13
Officers	3,475	1.79
Other sales	3,282	1.69
					<hr/> £194,157 <hr/>	<hr/> 100.00 <hr/>

Building Work, Engineering, etc.

51. Although the majority of prisoners are employed on manufactures or domestic work, it is to building and similar work that the best labour is allotted, and this is in many ways the most suitable work in the prisons.

The employment on public works, such as quarrying at Portland and naval works at Chatham, which at one time occupied many thousands of convicts, is no longer available, and of recent years employment has been limited to work for the Prison Department.

In 1922-31 a daily average of 1,332 (13 per cent.) of the prisoners available for employment were so employed.

The work carried out by prisoners under the direction of Works Officers, with the assistance of some tradesmen and skilled prison officers (Trade Assistants), includes practically all forms of domestic building and engineering, as well as the maintenance of workshops, equipment and maintenance of power laundries, etc. The Works Branch is responsible for the installation and maintenance of the boilers, water supply, electricity, gas, ventilation, heating and drainage systems.

Improvements.

52. Various improvements have been carried out in recent years. At one time all cell windows were glazed with frosted glass, and there was no direct ventilation of the cells from the outer air. The Commissioners having decided that the policy of preventing prisoners looking out through their windows, or of having an opening in their windows, should be abandoned, the work of substituting clear glass and sliding panes in over 20,000 cells was carried out by prison labour during a period of five or six years.

Similarly, the abolition of naked gas jets in cells was undertaken, and gas boxes in corridor walls were substituted.

Construction and Reconstruction.

The old temporary Convict Prison at Borstal, near Rochester, was rebuilt as the first Borstal Institution by inmate labour after one cell block had been built by contract.

Feltham Industrial School was purchased from the L.C.C. and converted (almost rebuilt) by inmate labour.

At Camp Hill a new prison was built between 1909 and 1912 by convict labour. It was at first designed as a Preventive Detention prison, but is now in use as a Borstal Institution.

At Portland the convict cell blocks have been adapted for Borstal use by reconstructing the ground floors and cutting away the first floors of these five-storied stone cell buildings. The work was carried out by boy labour under supervision over a period of seven years.

An entirely new Borstal Institution is being built at Lowdham Grange, near Nottingham, an estate of some 360 acres having been purchased for the purpose. The system of working is the same as for works in the prisons; that is, a number of tradesmen work with the various building parties.

Housing scheme for officers.

53. At the end of the War work on providing Quarters for Officers at a number of places was in progress; e.g., at Borstal, Parkhurst, and Camp Hill. Immediately after the War the need for providing officers with quarters at a large number of prisons became pressing, and in 1919 the building of 250 quarters (at some 30 different prisons) was authorized, on condition that prison labour was used to the utmost possible extent in their construction.

In 1924 when the 1919 scheme for 250 houses was nearing completion the provision of an additional 150 quarters at various prisons was authorized. This scheme is now practically completed. Building contracts were not resorted to in the 1924 scheme, but at Manchester the site was too far from the prison to use prison labour for the actual building. The doors, windows, and most of the fittings were made up in the various prison workshops.

Central heating.

54. Camp Hill was the first prison where heating from a central boiler-house was adopted, the old system of heating the prisons throughout the country having been by low pressure hot water from separate boilers installed in the various buildings. After the War, the provision of central boiler-houses and the adaptation of the existing hot water heating systems was undertaken under a progressive scheme largely by the use of prison labour. The work is still in progress.

Workshops and Stores.

In recent years the need for more accommodation for associated labour and for better storage accommodation for prison stores, raw material, and manufactured goods, has necessitated the building of many new workshops and stores and the rearrangement of existing accommodation for these purposes (see the list in paragraph 14).

Electric Light.

The general substitution of electric light for gas has been taken up during the past two years.

55. In all this work the Surveyor has in mind the importance of employing prisoners, and he designs and carries out his building and engineering work accordingly. In certain cases, e.g., at Wakefield and in the Borstal Institutions, it is of considerable value as a training for employment after release, but the funds provided for carrying out any building or engineering services do not allow for waste, and this is a serious handicap to any attempt to

use the work as a means of training. Moreover, Works Officers, in an endeavour to get work well and expeditiously carried out, tend to employ the best prisoner tradesmen available, and this again prevents the employment of other prisoners who might benefit by training.

Domestic Services, Gardening, etc.

56. Domestic services employ a large number of prisoners (16-17 per cent.), and include cleaning, cooking, stoking, etc., while a small number are employed as hospital orderlies, assistants in the library, etc.

SCOTLAND.

57. In Scotland, generally speaking, all work is done in association, but prisoners who are illiterate and cannot read or write, and any others who for any reason require some form of occupation for their leisure hours, are allowed to work in their cells in the evenings if they desire.

All fit prisoners except untried prisoners are required to work, and, as far as possible, employments are graded to suit the physical and mental capabilities of the prison population. The policy of the Department has been generally to inculcate habits of industry, and occupations have not been chosen with any particular reference to their value as training for employment on discharge. Only in the case of some convicts and a few long-sentence prisoners has any attempt been made to give any form of vocational training.

58. In 1932 the prison population in Scotland was employed as shown below :—

Manufactures :				<i>Per cent.</i>	<i>Per cent.</i>
(a) Mailbags	4.67	} 45.94
(b) Teasing	9.73	
(c) Other industries	31.54	
Domestic Services		26.37
Building Work		8.05
Farm Work		6.16
Non-effective (Sick, awaiting Trial, etc.)					13.48
					<hr/> 100.00 <hr/>

Manufactures.

59. Except for mailbag-making, the amount of work done in Scottish Prisons for other Government Departments is inconsiderable. One reason for this is that delivery is generally required at Depots in or around London, and the heavy cost of transport from Prisons in Scotland adds so much to production costs as to make such work uneconomic. Until 1932 substantial orders for mailbags for the General Post Office were undertaken, but the number ordered for delivery in 1933 is much smaller. In addition to mailbag making and repairing,

prisoners are employed in washing and remaking of bedding for military depots, washing of towels and dusters for various Departments, repairing of wooden and leather articles for the General Post Office, and manufacture of crates for H.M. Stationery Office. Some 60 convicts at Peterhead are engaged in quarrying granite for the Harbour of Refuge.

A great part of the labour in Scottish Prisons is used in the production of articles for sale in the outside market.

The principal industries are :—

Bag-making and Repairing	All Prisons, except Peterhead.
Baking (bread)	Edinburgh, Barlinnie, Perth, Peterhead.
Basket-making	Barlinnie.
Bookbinding	Peterhead.
Carpentry	Edinburgh, Barlinnie, Perth, Peterhead.
Carpet-beating	Dumfries, Inverness.
Corn-bruising	Dumfries.
Farming	Edinburgh, Barlinnie, Perth, Peterhead.
Gardening	All Prisons, except Duke Street.
Knitting	All Prisons, except Inverness and Island Prisons.
Mat-making	Edinburgh, Barlinnie, Inver- ness.
Net-making	Edinburgh, Aberdeen, Inver- ness.
Quarrying	Barlinnie, Greenock, Peter- head.
Shoemaking and Repairing	Edinburgh, Aberdeen, Bar- linnie, Greenock, Perth, and Peterhead.
Stone-breaking	Barlinnie, Dumfries, Greenock, and Peterhead.
Tailoring (including dress- making and other sew- ing).	All Prisons.
Teasing (hair, rope, wool, etc.).	All Prisons.
Washing	All Prisons.

60. It is noteworthy that every prison in Scotland except Duke Street Prison, Glasgow, possesses land suitable for cultivation, and the greater part of the vegetables required for prison consumption is produced therein. Most of the clothing, footwear, and bedding used is made in prison shops, as well as officers' uniforms, including the boots for males, some furniture and utensils and farm implements. Bread for prisoners' diets is baked in some prisons.

CHAPTER IV.

HOW WORK IS ORGANIZED.

61. For the purpose of this Report we have considered it sufficient to describe in some detail in the following paragraphs only the English system, as the method of control and administration of prison industries in the Scottish prisons corresponds closely to that in England and Wales.

The Controller.

62. At Headquarters the Controller of Stores and Manufactures is responsible for the organization of all manufacturing work in accordance with the policy of the Commissioners. He prepares the Estimate under the various subheads of the Prison Vote, he obtains and supervises the execution of all orders from Government Departments and quotes prices for such supplies. He is also responsible for the manufacture of clothing and other articles required for use in Prisons and Borstal Institutions. The re-stocking of prisons on reopening and the victualling and equipment of all establishments is under his control.

He has the assistance of a technical officer with engineering experience who was appointed primarily to advise in regard to the organization of the wood and metal workshops in the Borstal Institutions. In regard to particular industries, such as printing and textiles, the Controller is able to obtain and does obtain expert advice from the Stationery Office and the Manchester Chamber of Commerce Testing House.

The Controller places contracts for all materials that have to be purchased, but some Departments supply a substantial portion of the material required for the manufacture of the goods ordered, and these materials are as a rule paid for by the Commissioners.

The Controller receives returns showing (a) the weekly progress made on each order and the number of prisoners employed on each job, and (b) monthly the stocks of manufactured articles for prison use held by each establishment.

The prisons are visited regularly by the Controller and his staff, who inspect the industries and confer with the Governor and Steward on matters affecting industrial work.

The Steward.

63. The Controller's representative in the prison is the Steward who is responsible, under the Governor, for all the establishment, accounting and clerical services of the prison in addition to the manufacturing work. The stewards are recruited from the clerical staff and have not necessarily any knowledge of industry or workshop practice, though many of them acquire in the course of their service a useful working knowledge of prison industries. Their

time is very fully occupied with other matters and in a large prison the steward can devote only a limited time to the supervision of the manufacturing side of prison work.

The Surveyor.

64. The building and maintenance of all prisons is centralized under the Works Branch at Headquarters. The Surveyor is responsible to the Commissioners for the preparation of the estimates under the building subheads of the Prison Vote in conformity with the policy laid down by the Commissioners, and for the detailed administration of the building funds when voted.

The personnel at Headquarters consists of the Surveyor, two Assistant Surveyors, Clerks of Works, Architectural and Engineering Draughtsmen and Correspondence Clerks.

The prisons are divided geographically into a number of Works Divisions (about eight establishments in each), under a Visiting Clerk of Works, who is responsible to the Surveyor for framing the detailed estimates, for the inspection and supervision of, and the accounting (Works accounting) for, all work in his Division.

The Works Officers.

65. At the prison all building work is carried out through the Governor, on whose staff there are one or more Works Officers of various ranks and grades (Foremen of Works and Engineers), depending on the size and importance of the prison, and they are promoted from rank to rank, and prison to prison, as vacancies occur or the works require. They enter the Prison Service as Discipline Officers, and in recruiting the Discipline Staff a proportion of men skilled in building trades is admitted with a view to their being trained for the Prison Works Staff, which they enter by a qualifying examination.

A number of Discipline Officers (at present 118) who have a knowledge of useful trades are employed directly under the Prison Works Officer as Works Trade Assistants, for which they are given a small yearly allowance. They work with their hands, assisting and instructing parties of prisoners. There are also a number of Building Trade Instructors—see trades marked * in paragraphs 67-68 and 69.

Instructing Officers.

66. A number of Civilian Instructors is employed at Borstal Institutions and at certain prisons, but generally speaking trade instruction in H.M. Prisons is given by men and women officers of the ordinary discipline staff who worked at a trade before joining the Service, or have since acquired the necessary knowledge by assisting Instructors.

The present instructing staff in the prisons† is as follows :—

67. 10 *Principal Instructors (Men)*.

Basic pay as for a Principal Officer plus a non-pensionable allowance of £20 per annum, rising by annual increments of £2 to £28 per annum. They are employed as follows :—

- 1 Bricklayer.*
- 2 Carpenters.
- 2 Tailors.
- 1 Weaver.
- 1 Pouchmaker.
- 3 Rugmakers.

—
10
—

Except the Pouchmaker and the three Rugmakers, who are prison taught, all these Prison Instructors were tradesmen before they entered the Prison Service.

68. 20 *Class I Instructors (Men)*.

Basic pay as for a Prison Officer plus a non-pensionable allowance of £20 per annum, rising by annual increments of £2 to £28 per annum. They are employed as follows :—

- 2 Basketmakers.
- 1 Brushmaker.
- 1 Builder.*
- 2 Carpenters.
- 1 Leatherworker.
- 3 Shoemakers.
- 5 Tailors.
- 2 Weavers.
- 1 Coir Mat and Matting Maker.
- 2 Tinsmiths.

—
20
—

Except the Brushmaker, the Coir Matmaker, and the two Tinsmiths, who are prison taught, all these Class I Instructors were tradesmen before they entered the Prison Service.

2 *Class I Instructors (Women)*.

Basic pay as for a Woman Prison Officer, plus a non-pensionable allowance of £20 per annum, rising by annual increments of £2 to £28 per annum. They are employed as follows :—

- 2 Dressmakers and Needleworkers.

Both were Dressmakers by trade before they entered the Prison Service.

† The instructing staff of the Borstal Institutions is set out in paras. 105 and 106.

69. 111 *Class II Instructors (Men).*

Basic pay as for a Prison Officer, plus a non-pensionable allowance of 10s. per head per annum on the average number of prisoners employed up to a maximum of £18 per annum. (Minimum allowance, £3 per annum.)

They are employed as follows :—

- 1 Basketmaker.
- 1 Bricklayer.*
- 1 Builder.*
- 5 Brushmakers.
- 5 Blacksmiths, Tinsmiths, etc.
- 5 Carpenters.
- 21 Gardeners.
- 26 Laundrymen.†
- 5 Matmakers.
- 1 Moulder.
- 2 Printers.
- 1 Quarryman.*
- 1 Rugmaker.
- 5 Ship Fendermakers.
- 11 Shoemakers.
- 8 Tailors and Needleworkers.
- 3 Twine Spinners.
- 2 Waterproof Pouch makers.
- 7 Weavers.

111

Of the Class II Instructors (men) 25 were tradesmen before entering the Prison Service. The remainder are prison taught.

18 *Class II Instructors (Women).*

Basic pay as for a Woman Prison Officer, plus a non-pensionable allowance of 10s. per head per annum on the average number of prisoners, up to a maximum of £18. (Minimum allowance, £3 per annum.) They are employed as follows :—

- 8 Laundrywomen.†
- 10 Needleworkers.

18

* These are employed by the Building Department.

† Laundry Instructors (Prisoners' Washing only) are paid as follows :—

£15 per annum for a population of over 300.

£10 „ „ „ „ up to and including 300.

In cases where two Instructors are required, each receives £10.

£3 per annum only is paid to officers not wholly employed on laundry work.

The laundrymen undergo a special course of instruction at Wandsworth Prison and subsequent examination by an Inspector of the Board of Education before appointment as Instructors.

A special allowance of £18 per annum is paid to the officer (a tradesman) responsible for the Laundry Training Class at Wandsworth.

Three Needleworkers were tradeswomen before entering the Prison Service. The remainder are prison taught.

The majority of the non-tradesmen Class II Instructors are in charge of small and relatively unimportant trade parties or act as assistants to qualified instructors.

70. 54 Class III Instructors (Men).

Basic pay as for a Prison Officer plus a non-pensionable allowance of 5s per head per annum on the average number of prisoners employed, up to a maximum of £15 per annum. (Minimum allowance, £3 per annum). They are all prison taught and are employed as follows :—

54 Mailbagmakers and kindred trades.

71. Prison industries are divided into two categories (II and III) to which Class II and III Instructors are normally appointed.

At some establishments Instructors are responsible for work which embraces both category II and III Industries. In any such case the allowance is based on the rate per head payable for each industry subject to a maximum of £18.

In category II Industries where the number of prisoners employed is large, or the work of special importance, a Class I Instructor is employed.

There are also two special Instructorships as follows :—

1 Superintendent of Printing at Maidstone Prison.

1 Superintendent of Weaving at Wakefield Prison.

Pay : 73s. by 2s. to 83s. a week (plus current bonus, plus quarters (pensionable value 12s. a week) plus uniform (pensionable value 2s. 6d. a week)).

Both were selected from a number of tradesmen candidates.

72. Civilian Instructors (not pensionable) are also employed as follows :—

1 Basketmaker	£4 2s. per week inclusive.
1 Brushmaker	£3 10s. per week plus bonus.
1 Carpenter	£4 2s. per week inclusive.
1 Machine Minder (Printing)	£4 7s. per week inclusive.
1 Moulder	£4 2s. per week inclusive.
1 Sackmaker (retired Prison Officer)	Difference between pay and pension.
1 Sawyer	£3 18s. per week inclusive.
1 Tailor	£6 13s. per week inclusive.
1 Tailor	£5 14s. per week inclusive.
1 Warp Dresser	£4 2s. per week inclusive.

Instructing Officers in Scottish Prisons.

73. There are no Civilian Instructors in the Scottish Prisons or Borstal Institutions, and all trade instruction is given by discipline officers chosen for the work because of their knowledge of the particular trade and of their ability to impart instruction. Generally speaking the Instructors acquired their knowledge before entering the Prison Service, but in a few cases, usually in industries in which little technical skill is required, they are prison taught. Instructors in Scotland are not graded; they receive the usual wages of their rank as discipline officers, and, at the discretion of the Prisons Department, may be granted, in addition, a non-pensionable instructing allowance; the allowance is assessed in each case on merits and is subject to review annually or at shorter intervals if necessary. Factors which affect the assessment are (1) size of party, (2) nature of employment, (3) output, (4) length of service and success as instructor, etc., etc. Allowances vary from a minimum of 2s. to a maximum of 6s. weekly, but there are certain industries at certain prisons in which it is considered no allowance is necessary.

At present there are 59 Instructors employed as follows:—

- 5 Bakers.
- 1 Basketmaker.
- 1 Bookbinder.
- 3 Carpenters.
- 2 Dressmakers.
- 4 Electricians.
- 5 Farmers.
- 1 Gardener.
- 5 Joiners.
- 2 Laundry workers.
- 1 Mailbagmaker.
- 2 Matmakers.
- 4 Masons.
- 1 Netmaker.
- 5 Painters.
- 1 Roadmaker.
- 3 Plumbers.
- 1 Quarryman.
- 2 Shoemakers.
- 2 Slaters and Plasterers.
- 4 Smiths.
- 1 Stonebreaker.
- 3 Tailors.

59

Of these, 47 were tradesmen before entering the Prison Service. The remainder are prison taught.

Hours of Work.

74. The aims of the Prison Commissioners are expressed in the Prison Rules made by the Secretary of State on the 4th April, 1931, as follows :—

“ Every prisoner, unless excused by the Medical Officer on medical grounds, shall be employed on useful work ; provided, however that offenders of the First Division and prisoners subject to the special rules relating to persons awaiting trial shall not be required to work at prison employments but may be so employed with their own consent.

“ No prisoner shall be employed on any class of work unless he has been certified by the Medical Officer to be fit for that class of work.

“ For prisoners who are required to work at prison employments, the hours of employment shall not be more than ten a day and arrangements shall, so far as practicable, be made for such prisoners to work for at least eight hours in associated or other employment outside their cells.”

This Rule gave effect to what had become at that time the general practice in all prisons, viz. the employment of all prisoners in association for as nearly as practicable eight hours a day.

75. In practice it was not found possible to secure that prisoners were actually employed in association for eight hours since this period included the time spent in getting men to and from their cells, a time which varied according to the size and construction of the prison, and it was further liable to be interrupted by intervals for attendance at chapel, exercise, bathing, visits, etc. On an average the period of actual employment might be fairly stated as $6\frac{1}{2}$ hours daily.

The rule giving statutory authority for the enforcement of an eight hour associated working day had only been made three months when the financial crisis forced upon the Commissioners in July, 1931, a reduction of the staff of the prisons in England and Wales.

This reduction made it impossible to continue to employ all prisoners for a nominal eight hour day of associated labour ($6\frac{1}{2}$ hours actual work) and in most prisons the actual period of associated labour was reduced to under 5 hours daily. A longer period continues to be worked in the Borstal Institutions, in certain specialized prisons such as Wakefield, and by certain parties of prisoners in other prisons. In consequence of the reduction in the hours of associated labour a corresponding increase was made in the hours of cell labour when work was available.

The estimates issued before the economy “ cut ” gave the staff required for the year as 1,683 for an estimated population of 11,550, while in 1932 with the reduced hours of labour a staff of 1,633 was

provided for an estimated population of 12,100. The Commissioners estimate that the actual saving in staff due to the reduction in the hours of labour amounted to about 110 officers, or, at mean rates, £22,000 a year.

Inducements to Labour.

76. Before the local prisons were taken over by the State in 1877 prisoners were rewarded for their labour by the payment of gratuities, and in some cases they received additional allowances for work performed in excess of the allotted tasks, e.g. 1d. for each additional yard of matting, 2d. for every additional ton of stone broken, and 9d. for every additional pair of boots made. With the transfer of the prisons to the State, payments to convicted prisoners for work done were abolished, although an alternative system of gratuities was introduced in connection with a system of privileges known as the progressive stage system. With the passing of the Prison Act of 1898 a system of remission of sentence was introduced dependent on industry and good conduct, and the system of gratuities for convicted prisoners was eventually abolished in 1913.

Money continued to be earned by debtor prisoners until 1931, but arrangements are now made by which in lieu of gratuities and earnings (debtors') an annual grant is made to the Prisoners' Aid Societies to be used for the relief of prisoners on discharge.

77. Until recently, therefore, the inducement to labour consisted in (a) the prospect of a remission of sentence up to a maximum of one-sixth, or in the case of Penal Servitude prisoners, of release on licence after three-quarters (in the case of women two-thirds) of the sentence had been served, and (b) the earning of privileges under a progressive stage system.

For both purposes an elaborate system of marks was worked out and remission of sentence or advancement to successive stages depended upon a prisoner earning a certain number of marks every day. The system was originally devised with the idea that it should operate not merely as a negative check on misconduct and idleness, but also as a positive stimulus to industry. It provides not only that marks may be forfeited as a punishment for idleness, but that the earning of full marks each day shall be dependent on a satisfactory day's work; and it is within the discretion of the officer who supervises the prisoner's work to award less than full marks. Little use is made of this power. Usually the officer gives full marks unless the work of the prisoner is so unsatisfactory as to deserve a report to the Governor for idleness. For an officer to decide that, though a prisoner has not been idle enough to deserve a report to the Governor, he has nevertheless not been industrious enough to earn full marks, is a difficult responsibility, especially as the date of the prisoner's release is dependent on the marks earned.

78. In an endeavour to find a solution to the problem of providing an effective inducement to labour the Prison Commissioners have already initiated certain experiments.

The most interesting of these is the system of payment introduced at Wakefield in 1929. In the first instance the scheme was financed by voluntary contributions from a group of persons interested in the development of prison employment; but the payments are now made from the Prisons Vote. Under this scheme prisoners are now divided into two stages. A prisoner on conviction is placed in the First Stage and cannot be considered by the Promotion Board for promotion to the Second Stage until he has spent 12 weeks in the First Stage. During this time he receives no payment.

In the Second Stage he receives a payment which, when it is possible to measure work, is based on output. The following examples illustrate the system in force. (1) A prisoner working on a power loom is required to reach a minimum weekly output of 130 yards of sheeting before he receives the weekly payment of 3d. For each yard in excess of this minimum he receives $\frac{1}{4}$ d. (2) A prisoner working in the tailors' shop on Admiralty overalls is allowed 4 hours 30 minutes for each article and receives a weekly payment of 3d. if he produces garments equivalent to 44 hours' work per week, and 1d. for the equivalent of each hour's work in excess of 44. (3) A prisoner working in the shoemakers' shop is allowed 1 hour 20 minutes for soling and heeling, 55 minutes for soling, and is paid 3d. if he reaches a time output of 44 hours, and 1d. for the equivalent of each hour's work in excess of 44. In some cases, e.g., in the twine shed, prisoners work as a group and are paid according to the output of the group. When it is not possible to measure the work the men are graded A, B and C, and are paid a weekly rate. Grade A is small and is reserved for specially skilled tradesmen or men of outstanding ability. Grades B and C are usually composed of equal numbers.

Specimen rates are as follows:—

			A	B	C
Kitchen (per week)	7d.	5d.	3d.
Laundry (per week)	6d.	5d.	3d.
Gardeners (per week)	6d.	4d.	3d.
Road Party (per week)	—	4d.	3d.
Stokers (per week)	7d.	5d.	3d.

The grade is decided by the Governor and advancement to a higher grade is entirely dependent on efficiency and ability.

79. The output required before a prisoner receives payment is based on the average normal output before the introduction of the scheme, plus a proportion varying with the industry but usually about 25 per cent. The results of the system of payment at Wakefield have been very satisfactory. There has been an increase of

output of from 25 per cent. to 30 per cent. as compared with the output before the scheme was introduced, and the general atmosphere of the prison reflects the increased interest and alertness of the prisoners.

A somewhat similar system has been introduced at the Borstal Institution at Lowdham Grange with satisfactory results, and at other Borstal Institutions a more modest system of payment is in operation (see paragraphs 108 and 109).

CHAPTER V.

THE VALUE OF PRISON LABOUR.

ENGLAND AND WALES.

80. We have found it difficult to arrive at any conclusion as to the value of prison labour. In accordance with the requirements of section 11 of the Prisons Act, 1877 certain returns on this matter are published annually in the Report of the Prison Commissioners, but they bear no relation to the monetary return available for the work done in the prisons.

For the preparation of this return, work done in the prisons is valued at rates which were originally fixed in 1897 to 1899, and have been varied from time to time only in respect of differences in the market value for labour to allow for variations in the cost of living.

In 1896 the Store Accountant of the Prisons Department examined exhaustively the system of valuing prison work. He found that it was customary to value work as follows:—

Local Prisons.

(a) *Cash producing industries.*—At actual ledger profit (i.e., presumably the return after deducting cost of materials and tools).

(b) *Prison supplies, domestic services, Prison building services and work for Government Departments,* per diem rates were used based on industrial wages, except that in the case of Post Office supplies the value of labour was shown as the difference between the Prison Department charges and a fair contract price.

Convict Prisons.

At rates representing the estimated value of the labour at piece rates, daily rates being used only where piece rates were impracticable.

The Accountant after this review recommended the thorough revision of the Convict Prison rates “on the basis of a rigidly fair valuation of the work done,” and the application of those rates to both Local and Convict Prisons.

He proposed that returns based on the new rates should be used primarily for noting the progress at each prison and for comparing the results obtained in the same industry in different establishments; and that the returns should form the basis of half-yearly industrial reports, and of trade allowances to instructors.

The Accountant himself prepared a revised list of rates for each industry (except building) and a Committee was appointed in 1896 to consider his suggestions. It adopted, practically unchanged, the rates suggested by the Accountant, whereupon, rather surprisingly as it seems now, he expressed the opinion that the rates proposed were too low, and asked for the appointment of a further Committee which should consider the rates proposed, bearing specially in mind—

“ (a) that prison work is done almost entirely by hand, not by machinery;

“ (b) that sweating rates must be avoided;

“ (c) that the task list should be kept well in view in fixing the labour rates.”

The new Committee (1897) obediently increased the rates in almost all cases by amounts varying from 25 per cent. to 400 per cent. and thus imported into the composition of the rates elements of unreality which they have never lost. The rates so arrived at were adopted in 1897 and they still remain the basic rates.

The rates fixed for industries, together with the minimum weekly tasks for prisoners of ordinary capacity working on an average 8 hours per diem resulted in the earning capacity of prisoners in industries being placed in 1897 at from 2s. 6d. to 15s. a week, according to occupation.

81. In 1921 the conclusion was reached that changes in outside wages made the rates in use no longer suitable, and it was decided that a percentage addition should be made to the 1897 rates corresponding to the increase in outside wages for the various employments. With the help of the Ministry of Labour the rates were revised, and since 1920-21 percentage additions have been made varying annually in accordance with information supplied by the Ministry as to the level of outside wages during the year. For the year 1931 the average percentage additions were:—

	<i>Per cent.</i>					
Manufactures	140
Farm work	125
Domestic Service	132

90 per cent. of the manufacturing work is valued at rates per article but the balance of the manufacturing work, and all farm work, domestic work and building work are valued at time rates, and it follows that, to the extent that an excessive number of men is

employed on a given piece of work through lack of suitable employment, not only do those men waste their time, but there is an automatic increase in the valuation placed on the work by the Commissioners under the time valuation system.

82. The 1897 basic rates, with the percentage variation suggested by the Ministry of Labour, produce the valuation of prison labour which is shown in the Reports of the Prison Commissioners. The recent figures of value of labour on this basis, exclusive of employment in building and domestic services of the several establishments, have been :—

—					Manufactures.	Farm work.	Total.
					£	£	£
1925	209,734	13,488	223,222
1926	213,377	12,272	225,649
1927	218,925	12,911	231,836
1928	240,179	12,130	252,309
1929	249,860	12,373	262,233
1930	249,054	12,169	261,223
1931	248,725	14,096	262,821
Total					1,629,854	89,439	1,719,293
Average per annum ...					232,836	12,777	245,613

That this valuation of labour is higher than the market valuation of the goods can support is shown by the result of an examination of six important articles of prison manufacture (out of a very large number examined) which are typical of the general position :—

Article.	Price charged for goods based on trade prices	Cost of materials, tools, instruction and other out-of-pocket expenses.	Difference between columns 2 and 3 representing amount available as return for prisoners' labour.	Valuation of prisoners' labour at the rates used by the Prison Commissioners (para. 81).
1.	2.	3.	4.	5.
	s. d.	s. d.	d.	s. d.
A.	4	3 $\frac{3}{4}$	$\frac{1}{4}$	3
B.	1 10	1 9 $\frac{1}{2}$	$\frac{1}{2}$	3
C.	3 5	4 1	minus 8	5
D.	3 9 $\frac{3}{4}$	3 4 $\frac{3}{4}$	5	2 6
E.	10 3	9 4 $\frac{3}{4}$	10 $\frac{1}{4}$	1 8
F.	2 11	2 9 $\frac{1}{2}$	1 $\frac{1}{2}$	4

It will be seen that there is a very large margin between the value as ascertained by the rates used by the Prison Commissioners and that arrived at on the basis of the actual trade prices received.

83. The valuations based on the rates used by the Prison Commissioners have, in fact, no relation to the sums received by the Prison Commissioners in respect of goods supplied to other Departments for whom about 98 per cent. of the work is done. The Departments pay in some cases at the same rates as they pay for trade supplies, and in other cases at rates calculated to cover the cost of materials, tools, instruction, and other out-of-pocket expenses. The cash receipts of the Prison Commissioners from this source are shown in column 2 of the following statement, and the corresponding value of goods made for use in the prisons is shown in column 3.

Year.		Receipts from sales.	Value of goods made for prison use.	Total.	Cost of materials, tools and instruc- tion.	Balance Return for Prison Labour.
1.		2.	3.	4.	5.	6.
£		£	£	£	£	£
1925	...	217,988	94,143	312,131	272,369	39,762
1926	...	171,069	91,838	262,907	262,120	787
1927	...	175,161	91,549	266,710	262,868	3,842
1928	...	212,923	87,804	300,727	269,470	31,257
1929	...	201,798	79,418	281,216	225,023	56,193
1930	...	199,520	76,480	276,000	284,348	— 8,348
1931	...	180,644	68,783	249,427	226,459	22,968
Total		1,359,103	590,015	1,949,118	1,802,657	146,461
Average per annum.		194,157	84,288	278,445	257,522	20,923

The drop in receipts in 1926 was due to greatly reduced demand for mailbags. The fall in 1931 was due to (a) lower value of articles manufactured due to reduced cost of materials, and (b) the smaller demand for mailbags.

The gradual and general fall in the receipts from sales and value of goods used in prisons was due to the fall in the cost of materials, particularly flour.

Against the receipts must be set the cost of raw materials, tools, etc., and the balance which represents the value received for prison labour will be seen to be on the average only about £21,000 per annum (column 6). As regards those goods which are sold not at trade rates but at a figure based on the cost of materials, tools, etc., it may be that there is a hidden subsidy to Departments owing to no charge being made for prison labour on this class of goods, but there are no data available on which a conclusion on this point can be based and we have therefore found it impossible to arrive at any exact estimate of the value of prison labour engaged in manufactures.

In outside industry the ratio of wages to selling price of manufactured articles may vary from 10 per cent. to 80 per cent. but in view of the facts that in prison much work is done by hand which in outside industry is done by machines and that the labour is of a poor average quality, badly organized, and with insufficient stimulus to real effort, it is obvious that the proportion of the selling price of prison goods represented by the labour must be very low. We think that taking these considerations into account it would be fair to say that not more than one-sixth of the £278,445 worth of goods made in prisons should be credited for labour, that is £46,400.

We do not put forward this figure as more than a rough estimate of the value of the prison labour engaged on manufactures. The real value is probably somewhere between the £21,000 referred to in column 6 of the last table and the above figure (£46,400) and not £245,613 which is the average annual valuation set out in the Reports of the Commissioners. Where no sufficient data are available, it is impossible to do more than guess, but we can see no more likely basis for a figure than that which we have set out above.

Building work.

84. As concerns building work, hourly rates of valuation were fixed in 1899 as follows :—

Bricklayers, masons, carpenters, joiners, plasterers, plumbers, gasfitters, smiths, fitters, slaters	...	5
Painters, glaziers	4
Labourers	3

The valuation was at half the rates then current for free labour. These rates, as in the case of those for industrial work, remain the basis of the present day valuation, but, as in the case of manufactures, they are subject to percentage additions to bring them into relation with the level of outside building. The addition to these rates for 1931, on information supplied by the Ministry of Labour, was 56 per cent.; and the valuation of building labour in recent years on the basis of these rates, has been:—

is on the basis of these rates, has been :—							£
1925	69,590
1926	77,127
1927	79,561
1928	74,358
1929	76,943
1930	83,740
1931	79,330
							£540,649
Average per annum							£77,235

We have endeavoured to find a valuation which might be more acceptable as a fair statement of the value of prisoners' work.

85. There is recorded in the accounts of the Prison Commissioners the annual expenditure on contract work, materials and free tradesmen's wages, but for only one year (1925) were figures available showing the distribution of this expenditure between the three items mentioned; they were :

				£	Per cent.
Contract work	7,385	10.6
Materials	46,178	66.6
Free tradesmen	15,839	22.8
				<hr/> 69,402 <hr/>	<hr/> 100.0 <hr/>

and in that year more than the usual proportion of free tradesmen is stated to have been employed by reason of the building of officers' quarters at Manchester on a site too far removed from the prison to permit of prisoners being employed. We are accordingly content to assume that on average 15 per cent. of the expenditure is in respect of free tradesmen and 10 per cent. on contract work, leaving 75 per cent. for materials.

The average annual expenditure on the items stated during the 7 years 1925-1931 was £78,512, and 75 per cent. of this, viz., £58,884, should be regarded as the expenditure on materials.

86. We are given to understand that it is commonly found that expenditures on labour and materials in new building work are approximately equal, and we therefore made first the very broad assumption that the value of all labour using £58,884 worth of materials was itself worth £58,884.

At this stage we found that the material was used by—

- (a) the free tradesmen already referred to;
- (b) trade instructors and assistants in the Prison Service;
- (c) prisoners.

As to (a) assuming the value of the free labour to be 15 per cent. of £78,512 = £11,777 the value of the materials used was £11,777.

As to (b) the wages of this class totalled about £22,000 per annum, and as we assume that not less than half their time was spent on actual building work, as apart from instruction to prisoners, they used materials worth £11,000.

There is left for (c) (the prisoners) a net total of material valued at £36,107, and on the hypothesis stated, their labour should be valued at £36,107 instead of the valuation of £77,235 referred to in paragraph 84. This valuation is equivalent to about 11s. 0d. per week of 44 hours (the actual working hours do not in fact amount to 44 per week).

87. This calculation is confirmed by calculations made independently by one of our members (Mr. James Scott) and the valuation is in line with the return calculated for the work of Borstal boys at Lowdham, referred to in paragraph 110.

The valuation shown for the work of the Borstal boys at Lowdham is in fact a little higher, proportionately to the time occupied in the work, but this may be due to the fact that small "wages" were paid to the boys to stimulate energy and interest in the work.

88. The total value of the work of prisoners in all the prisons engaged on work other than domestic services then becomes as a maximum :

			£	
Manufactures and Farm	46,400	(para. 83)
Building work	36,100	(para. 86)
Total			82,500	

instead of the valuation given in successive reports of the Prison Commissioners and summarized as follows :—

			£	
Manufactures and Farm	245,613	(para. 82)
Building	77,235	(para. 84)
Total			322,848	

SCOTLAND.

89. The following table, which has been compiled on the same basis as that for England and Wales, shows the financial results of manufactures and farm work in Scottish Prisons for the years 1925 to 1931.

Year.					Receipts from Sales.	Value of goods made for prison use.	Total.
					£	£	£
1925	25,988	11,507	37,495
1926	26,030	11,807	37,837
1927	24,747	11,923	36,670
1928	17,298	11,873	29,171
1929	22,144	10,876	33,020
1930	21,402	9,470	30,872
1931	18,980	8,362	27,342
Total					156,589	75,818	232,407
Average per annum					22,370	10,831	33,201

The gradual drop in the value of goods made for prisons was due to the fall in the cost of materials, particularly of flour.

90. To arrive at a valuation of prisoners' work (excluding domestic service) comparable to the English figures we should assume one sixth of the value of manufactures and farm work, i.e., £5,540 and add a valuation of building work done in the Prisons. This, on the basis assumed for prisons in England and Wales, shows a value of about £2,900.

The total value of prisoners' work in Scottish Prisons is therefore, on the basis of valuation we have assumed, approximately as follows :—

						£
Manufactures, etc.	5,540
Building work	2,900
						<hr/> 8,440 <hr/>

instead of the valuation of £47,000 placed on it by the application of the rates hitherto in use.

The Scottish prisons sell to outside consumers a greater proportion of their output than is the case in English prisons, and the actual return from sales, after meeting the recorded costs of production, over the 7 years we have considered, was £8,366. This figure suggests that in regard to simple work, of which there is a greater proportion in Scottish than in English prisons, the proportion of the value represented by labour is greater than one-sixth the proportion on which our valuations have been based.

CHAPTER VI.

THE BORSTAL INSTITUTIONS.

91. Some reference has been made to Borstal Institutions in the preceding chapters, but as they form a distinct section of the establishments administered by the Prison Authorities and present special problems which, in view of the rapid growth of the Borstal population in recent years, are of increasing importance, it will be convenient to deal with them separately.

ENGLAND AND WALES.

General distribution.

92. There are six Borstal Institutions for boys, viz., (1) the original Institution at Borstal, near Rochester; (2) Feltham; (3) Portland; (4) Lowdham—a new institution in process of construction; (5) Camp Hill in the Isle of Wight, which has recently been converted from a Preventive Detention Prison to a Borstal Institution; and (6) Sherwood, the latest Borstal Institution which is accommodated in the former prison at Nottingham.

Boys sentenced to Borstal Detention are in the first instance collected at Wormwood Scrubs Boys' Prison.

Boys who, after release from Borstal Detention on licence have had their licences revoked are collected in the Borstal Wing of Wandsworth Prison and serve their period of detention under the revoked licence there.

There is one Borstal Institution for girls—at Aylesbury.

93. The average daily number of boys serving sentences of Borstal Detention has risen from 1,164 in 1926 to 1,973 in 1932.

The corresponding figures for girls are 67 and 115.

The accommodation and population of the various institutions on 9th May, 1933, were as follows :—

			<i>Accommodation.</i>		<i>Population.</i>	
			<i>Boys.</i>	<i>Girls.</i>	<i>Boys.</i>	<i>Girls.</i>
Borstal	430	—	402	—
Feltham	395	—	391	—
Portland	461	—	432	—
Lowdham	170	—	169	—
Sherwood (Notting- ham)	196	—	63	—
Camp Hill	353	—	354	—
Wandsworth	214	—	126	—
Wormwood Scrubs	266	—	132	—
Aylesbury	—	342	—	114
			2,485	342	2,069	114

Conditions in which sentences of Borstal Detention may be passed.

94. Sentences of Borstal Detention can only be passed on young offenders of not less than 16 or more than 21 years of age, who, by reason of criminal habits or tendencies, or of association with persons of bad character, are deemed to be in need of training.

A sentence of Borstal Detention can only be passed by a Court of Assize or a Court of Quarter Sessions. A court of Summary Jurisdiction has no power to pass such a sentence, but it is in this court that one or other of the alternative procedures leading to Borstal Detention is initiated. The Court of Summary Jurisdiction may either commit for trial in the ordinary way, or if it is proved that the offender has previously been convicted of any offence, or, that having been previously discharged on probation, he failed to observe a condition of his recognizance, it may convict and commit him to Quarter Sessions for sentence under Section 10 of the Criminal Justice Administration Act, 1914. In either case the court must give an opportunity to the prison authorities to make a report as to the offender's suitability for Borstal Detention, and as a result of these reports offenders who are physically or mentally unfit are, as a rule, excluded from the Borstal Institutions.

If the offender is ordered to be kept in custody pending his appearance before the superior court for trial or sentence, the time is spent in the local prison, the offender being located with other young prisoners awaiting trial. It may be as much as three months before his case is decided and he receives a sentence of Borstal Detention.

95. The period for which a boy may be detained in a Borstal Institution depends entirely on the view which the authorities take of his chances of making good if released. There is power to release a boy at any time after six months, and a girl at any time after three months. In practice such early releases are rare, and, except at Lowdham, where a certain number of boys are released after 12 months, it is usual for boys to serve at least 18 months, and more often two years, before release.

Release is on licence which requires the boy to be under the supervision of the Borstal Association. The licence remains in force for one year after the expiration of the Borstal Detention sentence, and may be revoked at any time within that period by the Prison Commissioners if the boy fails to observe the conditions of his licence.

A boy whose licence has been revoked is sent to Wandsworth Prison, where he is located in a separate wing and employed on heavy manual work, such as sawing or chopping wood, until such time as an Investigation Committee, consisting of the Visiting Committee, a representative of the Borstal Association, and a Commissioner or Assistant Commissioner, after inquiry into all the circumstances, think it right to recommend that he should again be released on licence.

Distribution after Sentence.

96. After sentence the boy is removed to the Boys' Wing of the Prison at Wormwood Scrubs where he is examined and very full enquiries are made into his character and antecedents in order that the Commissioners may decide to which Borstal Institution he may most suitably be sent.

In recent years the Commissioners have found it impossible to provide additional accommodation sufficiently quickly to keep pace with the rapid rise in the number of committals, and as a result the period of detention at Wormwood Scrubs has extended to two months and in some cases even longer. With the opening of the new institutions at Lowdham, Sherwood and Camp Hill, it has become possible to reduce this period, and we understand the average period now spent at Wormwood Scrubs is about five weeks.

After the enquiries are complete, an Assistant Commissioner with the assistance of the Deputy-Governor in charge of the Boys' Prison at Wormwood Scrubs decides to which institution the boy shall be allocated, and his transference follows immediately.

Classification of boys at Borstal Institutions.

97. The increase in the male population has made it necessary to open new institutions, and the Commissioners are now able to effect a classification, to allocate certain types of boy to certain institutions, and to modify the treatment as may be found most suitable to the type of boy located in the institution.

The existing arrangements are as follows :—

Borstal and Camp Hill take average boys.

Lowdham takes the most promising cases.

Feltham takes boys not up to the average physical or mental standard of Borstal inmate, and any surplus of most promising cases.

Portland takes the most difficult cases.

Sherwood takes the older type (between 20 and 21).

Wormwood Scrubs takes boys awaiting allocation.

Wandsworth takes boys whose licences have been revoked.

Training in the Institutions.

98. On arriving at the Borstal Institution a boy is employed for the first two or three months on cleaning and other domestic work, and is then usually drafted for six months into a labouring party. It is only after the completion of that period that he takes his place, if suitable, in a workshop. When to this period is added the time during which a boy may be detained in a local prison awaiting trial or awaiting sentence under Section 10 of the Criminal Justice Administration Act, 1914, and the time thereafter spent at Wormwood Scrubs before he is allocated to a particular Borstal Institution, it will be seen that many months may elapse after arrest before a boy actually enters upon a period of definite industrial training.

The course of treatment at the Borstal Institutions is designed first of all to repair the physical and educational deficiencies of the inmates and then to give a measure of industrial training to such as seem likely to benefit by it.

The only boys and girls sent to Borstal are those who, to quote the terms of the statute, are of "criminal habits or tendencies" and, as might be expected, they are often of poor education and physique. The training is usually highly successful in remedying physical defects. Classes are held for those of backward education. On the industrial side the comparatively short period for which the inmates are under training makes it impossible, except in the case of lads with special aptitude, to do more than train them up to improver standard, and in fact only some 45 per cent. of the boys passing through the wood and metal workshops reach this standard.

99. There are in the male Borstal Institutions 19 workshops with accommodation for 383 inmates, and on the 11th May, 1933, the number employed in these shops was 305.

The distribution of the boys among the main industries carried on in the shops was as follows:—

<i>Industry.</i>	<i>Number of boys employed.</i>
Carpentry	82
Shoe repairing	54
Smithing and Fitting	97
Tailoring	57

At Aylesbury there are two shops with accommodation for 60 and 30 girls respectively, and on the 11th May, 1933, 23 girls were employed on Needlework and Knitting in the former, while the latter was in temporary use as a recreation room.

100. The distribution of the working time of Borstal Inmates between the various occupations during the years 1924-29 was as follows:—

	<i>Per cent.</i>
Manufactures	27.3
Domestic Services	27.1
Building	23.4
Farm	16.9
Non-effective (sick, etc.)	5.3
	<hr/> 100.0 <hr/>

101. The industries carried on at the Borstal Institutions are:—

Male.

Baking	All establishments.
Carpentry	Borstal, Feltham, Portland, Sherwood.
Boot and Shoe Making ...	Borstal, Camp Hill.
Boot and Shoe Repairs ...	All establishments except Lowdham.
Knitting and Repairs ...	All establishments.
Mattress making	All establishments.
Needlework and Repairs...	All establishments.
Smithing and Fitting ...	Borstal, Feltham, Portland.
Tailoring	Borstal.
Tailoring (repairs) ...	All establishments except Lowdham.
Farming	Borstal, Feltham, Lowdham, Portland.
Gardening	All establishments.
Land Reclamation ...	Borstal, Camp Hill, Portland.
Cooking	All establishments.
Laundrywork	All establishments except Lowdham.

At Aylesbury.

Baking, Cooking, Dressmaking, Knitting and Repairs, Laundry Work, Mattress making, Needlework and Repairs, Farming, Domestic Work, Gardening.

At all establishments except Sherwood special cookery courses are held twice a year at which 12 selected inmates receive a six months' training in simple cookery. An examination is held at the end of each course by the Universal Cookery and Food Association, and a certificate is issued to each candidate who qualifies. Similar courses and examinations are held at the Girls' Borstal Institution at Aylesbury.

Building Work.

102. At Borstal and Portland the reconstruction of the old convict prisons, and at Lowdham the building of the new institution, have provided useful building work for large numbers of boys. At Lowdham the erection of the steel framework, the roofing and certain specially skilled work, have been carried out by contractors, but the remainder of the work has been carried out by the boys under the direction of a number of trade instructors, and is striking evidence of what can be achieved by Borstal boys under skilled supervision and tuition. On a smaller scale some useful building work has been done by the boys at Feltham.

Land Clearance and Reclamation, &c.

103. At Borstal the clearing, levelling and cultivation of a large area of rough land on the hillside, at Portland the levelling of an old quarry and the construction of garden land, at Feltham the filling in of a large quarry with soil, at Camp Hill the reclamation of the forest land, and at Lowdham the construction of roads and drainage works, have provided a large amount of labouring work.

104. Since the employment at a Borstal Institution is intended primarily to fit the inmates to take up work on release, an effort is made as far as possible, according to the type of inmate in the different institutions, to make the conditions of employment as similar as possible to those in the outside world. Only such supervision as seems to be essential is exercised and whenever possible boys are encouraged to work without supervision. At Lowdham in particular it has been found possible to dispense with the procedure of parading the labour parties, and the boys are expected to report for work at the correct time in the same way as free workmen.

Instructors.

105. Instruction at the Borstal Institutions is given mainly by Civilian Instructors (not pensionable) as follows.—

1 Farm Bailiff	£3 18s. per week and a house valued at 10s. a week.
1 Carpenter and Inspector of Timber.		£4 12s. per week inclusive.
1 Cabinet maker	} Varying rates from £3 10s. 6d. to £4 2s. per week inclusive.
5 Carpenters	
3 Sawyers	
9 Smiths and Fitters	

106. When officers act as instructors, they are, as a rule, men who have acquired a knowledge of their trade before entering the Service. They are as follows:—

Men.

Principal Instructor.

1 Farming.

Class I Instructor.

1 Farming.

Class II Instructors.

1 Concrete Block Making.

3 Farming.

1 Gardening.

3 Laundrywork.

3 Shoemaking.

2 Tailoring.

Class III Instructors.

7 Assisting above.

5 Cooking and Baking.

Of these, 19 were tradesmen before entering the Prison Service. The remainder are prison taught.

Women.

Class II Instructors.

2 Cooking.

1 Domestic Economy.

1 Dressmaking.

1 Farm and Dairy work.

1 Laundrywork.

Of these, 4 were tradeswomen before entering the Prison Service. The remainder are prison taught.

The rates of pay are the same as those for Instructors at the Prisons (see paras. 67-70).

Hours of Work.

107. In all the Borstal Institutions the Prison Commissioners aim at keeping the inmates fully occupied throughout the day, beginning with physical training before breakfast, followed by a period of eight hours employment during the day, and classes, handicrafts and recreations during the evening.

The classes are conducted partly by the staff of the institution and partly by voluntary teachers from the schools and other educational establishments in the neighbourhood. A number of technical classes bearing on the employment followed during the day are arranged and in some cases boys attend evening classes at technical institutes in the nearest town.

Inducements to labour.

108. The chief inducement is of course the prospect of early release on licence if a boy shows by his conduct and industry that he is making a serious effort to make good. There is at each institution a system of grades to which a boy may be promoted, each grade carrying with it certain privileges and in particular the privilege of greater liberty and responsibility.

A small amount of money known as "badge money" is available out of which payments are made in accordance with the authorities' assessment of a boy's industry. This may be spent at the canteen in any way the inmate thinks fit. Under this scheme a boy may earn an amount increasing, according to grade, from 3d. a week during the second three months of his sentence to 7d. a week. These payments depend upon general conduct and industry, but have no relation to a boy's actual output.

These payments are now referred to as earnings.

Lowdham Scheme.

109. At Lowdham a payment scheme is in operation. Pending vacancies in their selected trade parties, boys are drafted into labourers parties, which are divided into five categories. They start in the lowest category and are promoted if their industry and physical capacity merit it. They work in groups of 8-10, and in order to earn anything must perform a given minimum of work within a standard time. For every hour less than the standard time by which the minimum is completed each group receives payment at an hourly rate, the payment being shared by all members of the group.

The lowest category of labourer is usually employed on work which cannot be measured, and receives a flat weekly rate of 4d., 5d., or 6d.; for the higher categories the rates are higher, the average rate is about 1s. for the highest category, though as much as 1s. 10d. has been earned.

As vacancies occur a boy is absorbed into his selected trade party as a beginner at 7d. per week, and, subject to a satisfactory report from the Trade Instructor, he is promoted at 3-monthly intervals to :—

						Per week.	
						s.	d.
Novice	8	
Junior Apprentice	10	
Senior Apprentice	1	0
Improver	1	2

Some boys do not get beyond the grade of junior apprentice before discharge.

As nearly all the boys are beginners at their trades, payment is not assessed on output as it is felt that measurement can only be made satisfactorily by the assessment of their progress in learning.

In addition to Trade and Labouring Parties, there is an unpaid party. Any boy whose work or conduct at work is so poor that he would risk dismissal from his work under an employer in civil life is relegated to an unpaid party. He then gets no pay, and is therefore debarred from taking part in the social activities of the place. He has no money for his subscription to the football or cricket club, or for his ticket for any concert or cinema show. Neither can he purchase anything from the canteen. He will regain his place in the lowest category of the labouring parties, and later, perhaps, in his trade party, when he has proved, under close supervision, that he can work steadily and conduct himself properly.

The additional expense to the State of the Payment Scheme as compared with Badge Money payments elsewhere in force is under £1 per head annually.

The Governor of Lowdham has expressed the opinion that the payment of a small sum, so long as it is related to the amount of work done, completely alters the outlook of the boy in regard to his work, and increases the value of his Borstal training.

Value of Work in Borstal Institutions.

110. No reliable figures are available on which the value of the labour of the boys at Borstal Institutions can be assessed, but in view of the fact that much of the work in the shops is instructional it is in many cases unremunerative. The building work on the other hand seemed to us likely to be of a more economic character, and in order to gain a definite idea of the value of the boys' labour one of our members, Mr. James Scott, with the assistance of a War Office Surveyor, has made an estimate of the value of the administrative block already erected at Lowdham.

Mr. Scott estimates the value to be £15,571, against which must be set an expenditure on free labour and materials of £14,072, leaving a balance of £1,499 as the value of the labour of the boys. This gives a weekly value of the boys' labour of 12s. 9d., including the 9d. actually paid to the boys. The value might have been greater but for the fact that, in view of the need to provide accommodation for the rapidly growing population, certain work was treated as urgent and entrusted to free workmen which would in normal circumstances have been reserved for the boys themselves. The ratio of free workmen to boys was 1:1.93. The ratio was 1:3.50 on parts of the Lowdham establishment built later where less free labour was used, and as regards a block of two officers' quarters which was investigated the value was estimated at £1,663: deducting from this the expenditure on free

labour and materials (£1,295) the value of the boys' labour was estimated at £368, or nearly 28 per cent. of the cost, as compared with only 10 per cent. in the case of the administrative block.

The Girls' Borstal.

111. This is situated at Aylesbury and has accommodation for 342 girls though the actual population is only about 120. They are employed on gardening, cooking, laundry, decorating and repainting. After the working day has ended they are occupied in educational classes and in needlework (making of children's dresses, pyjamas, nightdresses and underclothing, and remaking of old garments), carpentry and household repairs, and cooking, including simple lessons on food values and marketing.

The recent introduction of a physical training instructor has been found to be of great value both from the physical and the mental and moral point of view.

A system of badge money similar to that described in para. 108 is in force.

SCOTLAND.

112. There is only one main Borstal Institution for each sex in Scotland; the Institution for boys is at Polmont, Stirlingshire, whilst that for girls is a wing of Greenock Prison. In addition, there are Borstal sections for boys at Edinburgh and Barlinnie Prisons, and a section for girls at Edinburgh Prison. The Edinburgh boys' section receives from Polmont Institution, a few weeks prior to discharge, lads who will eventually be liberated to districts in the East of Scotland. It is believed that this arrangement facilitates placing the boys in employment. The girls' section at Edinburgh takes those whose licences have been revoked, whilst the Barlinnie section receives boys in like condition.

As there is only one main Institution for each sex, there is no need for a collecting centre and no opportunity for classification.

The accommodation at the various Institutions is shown below, together with the average daily number in 1932 in each establishment—

				<i>Accommo- dation.</i>	<i>Popula- tion.</i>
Polmont Institution	226	202
Edinburgh—boys	71	14
Barlinnie	100	37
Greenock	32	13
Edinburgh—girls	14	1

There is also accommodation at Jessiefield Institution, Dumfries, for 18 girls, but this was found to be unsuitable and is not now used.

113. The pre-sentence procedure in Scotland is similar to that in England, but no time is lost in despatching sentenced persons to their respective Institutions. On arrival there, however, a period of time is spent in the recruits' party, which is employed on

domestic and labouring work, and in which physical, mental and moral training prepare the newcomers for the instructional courses to which they will later be posted.

The average time spent in a Borstal Institution in Scotland is about 18 months, and it may be fairly stated that the qualifications for employment in industry of lads leaving the Institution are no higher than those reached in Institutions in England.

Industries available.

114. The industries carried on at Polmont Institution are cooking and bread-baking, carpentry, boot and shoe making and repairing and other leatherwork, smithing, tailoring, farming and gardening, book-binding, and brushmaking. A number of the lads are employed by the Surveyor's Department in the various building trades.

In the Edinburgh section for boys, farming is the principal occupation, whilst the revoked licenceholders at Barlinnie are employed at basket-making and stone-breaking.

The girls at Greenock learn cooking, dressmaking, knitting, laundrywork, needlework and domestic work. Those at Edinburgh are similarly employed.

Instructors.

115. No civilian instructors are employed in Borstal Institutions in Scotland, but the officers appointed to instruct have been specially selected and are, generally speaking, well qualified tradesmen. They receive, in addition to their pay as Warders, a Borstal allowance of 3s. per week, and an instructing allowance which, according to circumstances, may be as low as 2s. 6d. per week or as high as 6s. per week.

General comments.

116. Although industrial training is an important feature of the Borstal system we have found that the various instructors are as much concerned with the financial as with the educational aspect of their work, and, in their anxiety to avoid showing a loss on any contract, are more careful of the materials handled in their shops than they would be if training of their charges were recognized to be their principal duty. As a result of this pre-occupation with costs, instructors perform themselves much of the skilled work and the trainees' education suffers accordingly.

117. In general we would record that we were very favourably impressed by the happy relations of officers and boys in the Borstal Institutions, and with the spirit in which the work of the Institutions is organized. When it is remembered that many of these boys have never been in employment of any kind before their committal to Borstal Detention, it is obvious that the task of training them to habits of industry and good citizenship is one which demands from the staff great qualities of tact and leadership.

CHAPTER VII.

OBSERVATIONS ON THE PRESENT CONDITIONS OF EMPLOYMENT IN PRISONS, BOTH ENGLISH AND SCOTTISH, AND RECOMMENDATIONS.

118. We would preface our observations on the state of employment in prisons by saying that we have been impressed in the course of our inquiry by the complexity of the subject.

Poor quality of labour.

119. The labour available and the conditions of its employment are not comparable with what is to be found in outside industry, and indeed the whole question of prison labour is inseparable from difficulties due to prison discipline and treatment. Whilst these difficulties are axioms of the problem to people in the Prison Services, it seems worth while here to refer briefly to some of them for the information of the general reader. We have already written of the poor type of the prison population from an industrial point of view. Whilst the skilled workman is comparatively rare in this population, there is in it a larger proportion of unemployables (the almost mentally deficient, the drunken, the feeble, and the work-shy) than in the world outside.

Short sentences.

120. Another factor is the number of prisoners serving short sentences. Although the number of prisoners sentenced to imprisonment for two weeks or less has fallen from 109,015 in 1909-10 to 10,912 in 1931, it still represents an appreciable part of the daily average population of the prisons, and a part which is an obvious handicap on any attempt to improve prison industries. From the industrial as from every other point of view, the elimination of the short-term prisoner from the prison population is greatly to be desired.

121. For this incompetent and changing crowd of workers it is difficult to lay down with certainty long-range plans. The number of convictions in a year is subject to considerable fluctuations following fairly closely the figures for unemployment, but the number of prisoners, while it is influenced by the numbers of offenders found guilty by the Courts, is affected by other considerations which are impossible to foresee. Public alarm at a rise of crime tends to express itself in a reluctance to use alternatives to imprisonment and in an increased length of sentences. There are, moreover, what may be described as fashions in the treatment of offenders. For instance, a new interpretation of "solicitation" or a different way of dealing with military offenders may have considerable effect on the population of a particular prison. It will be seen at once that this uncertainty as to the amount of labour to be counted on in the future complicates the question of providing expensive equipment or the undertaking of contracts over a long period.

Shortage of suitable work.

122. But the most serious problem which the Prison Authorities have to face is the shortage of simple work suitable for unskilled and short-term prisoners. A man who sits beside an idle machine sewing a mailbag by hand to make his work last longer can hardly be expected to exert himself fully, and when once this rot of slackness sets in it is hard to extirpate. The absence of incentive is a difficulty which will occur to everyone. The fear of dismissal is an obvious motive for hard work which is absent from prison labour. We have evidence that during the War officers and prisoners exerted themselves fully, and that even now in an emergency work is done at high pressure. Moreover, in some of the higher grade industries carried out in prison a real pride of craftsmanship can be found. But the practice of having to spin out work in the simple industries, owing to lack of orders, is far too general and is itself one of the gravest obstacles to better results.

Medical aspect.

123. In prisons, as in other institutions, the medical aspect of employment is bound to assume a greater importance than in the outside world. The Prison Authorities, in their very proper desire to avoid doing anything which might give rise to the criticism that prisoners were being harshly or unfairly treated, take meticulous care to avoid employing a prisoner on any work for which he may be physically or mentally unfit.

Security.

124. Two further points may be mentioned. The Prison Authorities are primarily under an obligation to keep safely the prisoners committed to their charge. This entails constant supervision with the result that jobs such as building repairs, which require only a few men and might be economically undertaken in ordinary circumstances, become extremely expensive when the time of a supervising officer has to be allowed for.

Training and Education.

125. The Prison Authorities are also, and to an increasing degree, expected to arrange for such treatment and education of prisoners as may give some hope of returning them to society as law-abiding citizens, able to earn an honest living.

This implies that, at any rate as regards the younger men and women serving sufficiently long sentences, some kind of training should wherever possible be provided and that they should not be put to types of mechanical work merely because these are the most remunerative. The more completely effect is given to this desire that these younger prisoners should be given work having an instructional value, the more difficult it becomes to secure that their labour shall be made remunerative to the State.

126. In general it may be said that the reclassification of prisoners demanded by the important reforms of the last few years has inevitably tended to dislocate industrial work. All these points must be borne in mind in comparing the prison system with industrial organizations of free labour.

General conclusion.

127. But when all allowance is made for the peculiar difficulties of the problem, we think there are certain steps which can be taken to improve the methods of employment of prisoners with advantage both to the State and to the prisoners themselves. In saying this we recognize the very substantial advances in general prison conditions and in the organization of prison industries which have been effected by the Prison Authorities in recent years. The War and subsequent financial difficulties have hampered development, and in fact we have found in the course of our investigations that many of the difficulties referred to in the Report of the Gladstone Committee of 1895 have reappeared in the post-War period.

Principles of Employment.

128. As regards the principles which should underlie all prison employment we cannot do better than quote the late Chairman of the Prison Commission (Mr. A. Maxwell): "Prisoners should be usefully employed and the choice of employment should not be limited by the old "hard labour" conception, i.e., the conception that prison labour should have an intentionally punitive character. Useful occupations should not be excluded from consideration merely because they are irksome—but irksomeness should not be regarded as a desirable or indispensable characteristic of prison occupations. If work is treated as a form of punishment, the inevitable consequence is that as little as possible will be done and interest and effort will be discouraged. The spirit in which work is regarded both by the prison officer and by the prisoner is more important than the nature of the work. However laborious or disagreeable a task may be, if the worker feels that he has been set to do it because its accomplishment serves a useful purpose, and performs it in a spirit of stoicism or service, he will profit from the experience. On the other hand, if the prisoner feels that the task is of an artificial character invented by the Prison Authorities either for the purpose of punishing him or merely for the purpose of keeping him occupied, he will perform it in a resentful or in a listless spirit, and the effect both on his character and on his usefulness as an industrial worker will be bad."

With this view we are in agreement. Continuous and useful employment must be regarded not as a punishment but as an instrument of discipline and reformation. In order that this idea may be achieved, the first requirement is that useful and suitable work should be provided *and that there should be plenty of it.*

If work has to be spun out or invented much of its value is lost. It serves to inculcate bad habits in Instructors and prisoners and it cannot be made economic.

Training or Occupation.

129. At this point it will be convenient to consider a question which has been constantly put before us in the course of our enquiry, namely, how far it is possible to utilize a prison sentence to teach prisoners a trade which will be useful to them on discharge. As regards the majority of prisoners, we are satisfied that because of the shortness of their sentence (in 1931 over 89 per cent. of male prisoners in England were sentenced to imprisonment for not more than six months) and their own physical and mental shortcomings it is not practicable to teach them a trade. The most that can be done is to provide work which will accustom a prisoner to habits of industry and to the speed which is required in outside employment, and in that way improve or at least maintain his fitness for employment on release.

There is general agreement that no attempt at industrial training can be made with any hope of success except in the case of Borstal inmates and prisoners under the age of 30, and in the latter case only as regards such as are serving sentences of at least 12 months. It is rarely possible to train either prisoners or Borstal boys to the standard of skilled craftsmen, but much can be done, in selected cases, to discharge a man better fitted to fill a place in industry than on his reception in prison. It is desirable that in suitable cases a real training should be given in shops equipped with machinery of the type to be found outside. Training should be the main aim and in the cases where this is attempted the idea of output on a manufacturing basis or of financial return for work done should not be pursued to the detriment of training. There should be, in the course of this training, progressive tests which a trainee should be required to pass as a condition of remaining in training.

We have had the opportunity of seeing, at certain Ministry of Labour establishments, valuable and even ingenious training work for unemployed on the manufacture of useful articles from waste material and we think the Prison Authorities, by a study of the Ministry of Labour system, might obtain useful hints regarding occupational training for some prisoners.

For that part of the prison population which is not suitable for training the problem is one of providing useful, healthy and remunerative work of a simple kind, and, as Mr. Maxwell observed, the nature of the employment is of less importance than the spirit (and we would add the speed) with which it is carried out.

Speeding up.

130. We think that a speeding up of work in prisons is imperative, not only in the interests of the State which has to bear the burden of maintaining the prisons, but also in the interests of the

moral and physical rehabilitation of the prisoners themselves. Several witnesses told us that the effect of a prison sentence was to render the prisoner physically soft and mentally slow, and that this was a severe handicap to the prisoner in his search for employment on release. Some went so far as to suggest that in many cases a prison sentence amounted to scientific training in habits of idleness. On the other hand, many witnesses stressed the poor quality, from the industrial point of view, of the human material to be found in the prisons, and there is no doubt that many of the men and women whose work is slow in prison are equally slow in the outside world and that in many cases it is their very lack of energy and industry which is responsible for their lapse into crime. However this may be, there can be no doubt that it would be in every way desirable to secure a longer and more strenuous labour day for all prisoners who are medically fit to undertake it. If proof were needed that prisoners are capable of much greater effort than they normally expend, it is to be found in the results of the experimental schemes of payment at Wakefield and Lowdham, to which we have already referred.

131. As a result of our enquiries, we shall make certain proposals for reorganizing and speeding up prison employments which will, we hope, have the effect of securing for the State a greater return for the large sums expended; but in making our proposals we have borne in mind the fact that the main object of prison employment should be, not the exploitation of prison labour so as to secure a return to the State, but the rehabilitation of the prisoner.

Work for Government Departments.

132. At the outset of our enquiry we were informed that there was a serious shortage of simple work which made it difficult to keep prisoners fully employed.

Our first enquiries were therefore directed to this point and we saw representatives of the various Government Departments from which work is now obtained, viz., the General Post Office, Admiralty, War Office, Air Ministry, Office of Works and Stationery Office. We found them sympathetic to providing work for prison labour, and as a result of our interviews some new work has already been allocated to the prisons; but we realize that it has been customary to allocate to the prisons almost all the simple work suitable for unskilled labour and that no great increase of orders of this kind is to be looked for. There is, however, a considerable volume of work of other kinds available which could be given to the prisons if the Commissioners were ready to take it. Before this work could be accepted some important changes in the present organization would be needed and these are dealt with in the appropriate sections below. We recommend that arrangements should be made by the Prison Authorities, in consultation with the Departments, to secure that the maximum amount of suitable Government work should be allocated to the prisons and

in order that the importance of this matter may be kept constantly before the purchasing Departments, we recommend that the Prison Authorities should be permanently represented on the Contracts Co-ordinating Committee.

We recommend later that a new post of Industrial Commissioner should be created. This officer should be the representative of the Prisons Departments on the Contracts Co-ordinating Committee, and should keep in constant touch with the purchasing Departments and see that no opportunity of doing work for them is missed.

Steps for securing more Government work.

133. We have considered whether steps should be taken to introduce a compulsory system of State use as in certain American States, but we make no such recommendation. We understand that in practice such legislation has not proved capable of enforcement, and it seems to us to be alien to British methods of administration.

In 1923 a circular was issued by the Treasury drawing the attention of Government Departments to the importance of placing orders whenever possible with the Prison Department, and we recommend that a further circular should be issued impressing on departments the great importance of this question in the interests both of national economy and of the reformatory work of the prisons. The matter is one which should be kept constantly before the purchasing departments by means of periodical reminders and close personal contact between the Industrial Commissioner above referred to, and the Directors of Contracts.

134. Apart from the work for Government Departments which can be done within the prisons, our attention has been called to the possibility of employing prisoners on Government work (such as building) outside the prisons. Building work has been done extensively by convict labour in the past, at Chatham, Portland and Portsmouth, and quarrying work is still being carried on by Scottish convicts for the construction of the harbour of refuge at Peterhead. In our view the Government has a clear right to supply its needs from its own resources, and in times of normal national prosperity we would not be averse to the employment of prisoners outside the prison on work for Government Departments provided that it could be carried on in reasonable seclusion. But at the present time there is an abnormal amount of unemployment in all branches of industry, and we consider that so long as these exceptional conditions exist it would be inexpedient to utilize prisoners on such work.

Price for Government Work.

135. We understand that the Prison Departments are often required to tender in competition with outside firms. In view of the importance of securing an adequate supply of work, we recommend that, where it is known that goods required by Government

Departments can be made satisfactorily by prison labour, the Prison Departments should be given the opportunity in all cases of undertaking the work at a price based on that ruling in the outside market. The prisons should, of course, be required to work to a definite date of delivery of goods.

Programme of Work.

136. The Prison Authorities cannot suddenly or quickly increase the number of workers to meet a "rush" order nor can they lengthen the hours of labour except within very narrow limits. It is important therefore, in order that they may be in a position to plan their work ahead, that they should know as early in each year as possible what work is available, and we recommend that the purchasing Departments should continue to notify them of their requirements for the ensuing financial year not later than the end of November.

We recommend that the Prison Authorities should be authorized after consultation with the purchasing Departments to manufacture stocks of goods in regular use. This is already done in the case of mailbags manufactured for the Post Office, and we see no reason why a similar policy should not be generally adopted.

It would have the advantage of enabling the Prison Departments to purchase larger quantities of raw materials when prices were favourable and would render unnecessary the transfer to other work of prisoners trained in the production of a given article.

As a corollary we suggest that purchasing Departments should as far as possible avoid altering patterns or specifications without reasonable notice and when changes become necessary should allow existing stocks of manufactured articles and raw materials to be used up.

Purchase of materials.

137. In cases where the Prison Authorities themselves buy materials, we recommend that they should get in touch with the large purchasing departments and arrange to take advantage of purchases under their contracts wherever this would be profitable. When other departments hold large stocks of materials arrangements should be made whereby whenever possible the Commissioners should be able to draw on these stocks as required. Such a procedure might, for example, be usefully followed in regard to their requirements of timber. We recommend that the possibility of co-operation on these lines should be fully explored by the Prison Authorities in consultation with the Army Ordnance Department and the Naval Store Department. We understand that from time to time the Prison Authorities are unable to obtain orders owing to

their inability to buy raw materials by competitive tender at sufficiently low rates to enable them to compete with outside manufacturers. In some cases, indeed, the price which Departments will pay does not cover the cost of the raw materials. We recommend that consideration should be given to the possibility of buying, as is customary in outside industry, at spot prices either direct or through an agent instead of by competitive tender.

In some cases the purchasing departments supply the materials to be made up, and we recommend that this practice should be made the rule rather than the exception.

Inspection.

138. We received evidence that in some cases prison-made goods had been rejected on account of minor faults which did not seriously detract from the serviceability of the articles concerned. It is clearly too much to expect that prison-made goods will consistently attain the standard of finish of goods made by free skilled workmen, and we think that goods should be accepted so long as they are reasonably serviceable for the purpose for which they are intended, subject, if necessary, to an abatement of price. In any case where it appears to the Prison Departments that goods have been unfairly rejected we think that they should take the matter up with the headquarters of the department concerned.

139. We understand it is the practice of several large purchasing Departments to require delivery of manufactured goods to be made to central Depots—generally in the Southern Counties—for examination by the Inspecting Branch. Other departments conduct the inspection in the prison and the goods are then delivered direct to the place where they are required. We recommend the extension of the latter practice.

Work for Local Authorities.

140. Just as we are satisfied that the active help of Government Departments must always be obtained in finding suitable work for the Prisons, we think there is another field for employment which, up to the present, has not been fully explored. We refer to the requirements of local authorities throughout Great Britain, whose needs are in many directions similar to those of the Government Departments. We recommend that local authorities throughout Great Britain should be approached with a view to the allocation to the Prisons of all possible work of a simple manufacturing character.

Work for outside market.

141. Work for prison purposes and for Government Departments provides practically the entire occupation of the English prisoners to-day, and the Commissioners have hitherto been deterred by the

fear of objection from outside manufacturers or workpeople from undertaking any considerable volume of outside work.

In principle the competition of prison labour with free labour is the same whether the articles made are for Government Departments or for sale in the outside market, though the effects of prison competition in the outside market are more obvious. We think it desirable that so far as possible prisoners should be employed on Government work, but in so far as such work may be found insufficient to keep prisoners fully employed we see no objection to outside work being undertaken subject to the conditions laid down in the Report of the Gladstone Committee of 1895, viz., that prison goods are not sold below the market price, and that every consideration is shown to the special circumstances of particular industries outside so as to avoid undue interference with wages or the employment of free labour.

The number of prisoners likely to be employed on such work at any time is so small in comparison with the outside labour market that the effect of their competition will be negligible provided there is a careful avoidance of concentration on a particular industry in a particular district.

Building work.

142. So far we have dealt chiefly with work of an industrial character which can be carried on in shops. It is in such employment that the largest group of prisoners is engaged. A smaller number are employed on works in the prison or in the building or repair of prison premises, while others are employed in gardening and agricultural work. Building and similar work is probably the most suitable and useful, but its amount is limited by the needs of the Prison Departments. Moreover it is expensive in supervision since parties cannot as a rule be employed without an officer, and in some instances, e.g., when one or two prisoners only are employed on a particular job it would certainly be cheaper to employ free labour. While the importance of employing prisoners on useful work may warrant such uneconomic employment in some instances, care should in our view be taken to avoid it wherever possible.

Agricultural Work.

143. The evidence we received was unanimous in approving the value both from the physical and moral point of view of gardening and agricultural work. We should like to see a considerable extension of the outdoor employment of prisoners, particularly of those specially fitted for such work and of those unlikely to benefit by industrial training.

The majority of prisons are situated in thickly populated areas and the land available is very limited and often unproductive. Such land as is available appears to be very fully utilized.

The following table shows for the years 1930-31-32 the total quantities of Potatoes and other vegetables used in the dietaries in English prisons, and the quantities grown on prison land :—

Year.				Potatoes.		Other vegetables.	
				Total Consumption.	Prison Grown.	Total Consumption.	Prison Grown.
				Tons.	Tons.	Tons.	Tons.
1930	1,391	439	520	264
1931	1,472	363	559	281
1932	1,648	308	651	304

The high cost of transport makes carriage of vegetables over long distances uneconomic, but both in England and in Scotland transfers are already made between certain neighbouring establishments, and we recommend that the possibility of extending the practice be closely considered.

Wherever it is possible to obtain suitable land in the vicinity of a prison on reasonable terms we are strongly of opinion that it should be acquired and brought under cultivation with a view both to the provision of employment and to making the prisons, so far as possible, self-supporting in the matter of vegetables.

Land Drainage, Afforestation, Reclamation, etc.

144. We have considered the possibility of the employment of prisoners on various works of public utility such as drainage work in the fens, land reclamation on the sea coast, clearing for afforestation, etc., and have heard evidence on this subject from representatives of the Ministry of Agriculture, the Ministry of Labour, and the Forestry Commission.

As regards all schemes of this kind we are impressed by the importance in the existing state of unemployment of avoiding any step which might give to prisoners work which might otherwise be allocated to the unemployed. We are satisfied, however, that there is a considerable volume of useful work of this kind available and it seems probable that in many cases it will not be put in hand even as a scheme for alleviating unemployment. We recommend that such work should be considered available for prison labour in suitable cases. We understand that the Prison Commissioners have already made some investigations into the possibility of undertaking such work by selected prisoners or Borstal boys housed in a huttled camp.

Land Drainage and Afforestation.

145. The necessity of supervision would make prison labour less suitable than free labour for drainage work in the fens. The work

would fairly rapidly move away from whatever site was selected for the camp and a disproportionate amount of time would be lost in getting the prisoners to and from work.

Moreover, the work would have the effect of improving the value of land in private ownership, and objection might properly be taken to the use of prison labour for this purpose unless all or part of the cost could be recovered through a drainage rate, which we gather would be unlikely. The alternative would be the acquisition of a large area with a view to re-sale after the land had been brought again into a cultivable state. In view of the administrative difficulties referred to above and of others to which our attention has been drawn, we are not impressed by the advantages of this type of work, and we do not recommend that it should be undertaken. We have come to a similar conclusion in regard to afforestation for the reason that it would not provide sufficient work in a limited area over any lengthy period for any considerable number of prisoners.

Land Reclamation.

146. As regards reclamation work on the coast, we understand that there are considerable areas ripe for reclamation, but that for financial reasons it has not been found practicable to proceed with this work with free labour. The Ministry of Agriculture are, however, anxious that it should be undertaken as soon as possible, and we think the question of undertaking it experimentally with prison labour is worthy of careful consideration. With the increase in the prison and Borstal populations it may shortly be necessary to provide further accommodation, and we are advised that it would be practicable to accommodate a large party of selected prisoners or Borstal boys in a hutted camp under minimum security conditions at considerably less cost than would be involved in building a new institution. The work itself is eminently suitable for prison labour, for it would provide valuable training in heavy labouring work and would be easily capable of measurement for purposes to which we shall refer in our proposals regarding the payment of prisoners. These considerations suggest that, while it may have been uneconomic to undertake the work by free labour, an experiment in reclamation by the use of prison labour might well be justified on broad financial grounds.

We recommend that the matter should be fully investigated by the Departments in consultation with the Treasury.

Farm Colony.

147. We have considered also the suggestions for the establishment of a farm colony for prisoners. A colony devoted entirely to farming would not employ sufficient labour to make it suitable for a prison establishment, but if market gardening and fruit growing were added and the colony included a certain area of land requiring reclamation it should be possible with such work as the making of packing boxes to provide sufficient work

all the year round for a considerable number of prisoners. We understand that the disposal of the produce in the open market would not be likely to arouse any serious opposition. Animals and other produce from prison establishments already find a ready sale in the local markets. We recommend that the question of setting up such a prison colony should be favourably considered when the question of providing further accommodation next arises.

If it is found possible to provide new accommodation on the lines suggested above, this will facilitate the redistribution of certain classes of prisoners, and of certain industries, both of which will be difficult to effect in present conditions where establishments are full and there is no margin of accommodation to allow of the necessary transfers.

Work in cells.

148. We were informed as to types of work commonly available in continental prisons for prisoners confined in cells; and we think that the Commissioners should consider the question of organizing the manufacture, for general trade, of small and light articles such as are made in the German prisons.

More Work the vital necessity.

149. We cannot stress too strongly the consideration which has been constantly placed before us that suitable employment is the most important factor in the physical and moral regeneration of the prisoner. The crux of the whole problem is the provision of a sufficiency of simple work. We have mentioned a number of directions in which additional work may be sought but it is important that every possible field of simple manufacturing work be fully investigated. If a sufficient supply of such work is not available the only alternative will be an increasing employment of prisoners on the land.

Modernization of Methods.

150. When in a given class of industry a sufficiency of work is in sight steps should be taken to modernize prison methods. In the past economy of production has not been given that prominence which it deserves and because so little work has been available many operations which could be more quickly and more efficiently done by machinery have been performed by hand. The sewing of mailbags is the chief instance of this practice.

We recommend that as and when other work can be found for a proportion of those now employed on mailbags the use of machines for the sewing of mailbags in association should be resumed. Another instance is to be found in the hand washing of clothes which goes on in many prison laundries. If modern machinery

were installed much more work could be undertaken, and we understand that it could be provided by the Office of Works, the General Post Office and other departments.

151. Adequate workshop accommodation is essential to any proper organization of prison industries. We have referred in paragraphs 14 and 54 to the steps which have been taken in recent years to provide workshop accommodation; but much remains to be done before the distribution and suitability of the workshop accommodation can be considered adequate, and the Prison Authorities must formulate and follow a settled policy in developing and organizing prison industries, in making additions to the existing workshop accommodation, and in providing suitable machinery wherever necessary. The equipment and lay-out of the kitchens should be modernized both in the interests of the dietaries and of the training of prisoners employed in the kitchens.

At the same time it is essential that adequate storage facilities should be provided in proportion to the expansion of prison trades. This has not always been done in the past and we have received evidence that in various establishments the proper running of the prison industries is seriously hampered by the lack of proper storage accommodation.

152. The use to which the shops are put also needs consideration. At present in many prisons a variety of industries is carried on on a small scale. If better methods are to be adopted and the work conducted on economic lines, the variety of industries in any one prison should be reduced, and steps should be taken to concentrate particular industries in selected prisons, having regard to the accommodation and labour available there and to such questions as facilities for and costs of transport. We suggest, for example, that instead of the small cobblers' shops which are to be found in almost every prison, large boot and shoe making and repairing shops should be established in one or two prisons which could deal with the whole needs of the prisoners and, with the improved supervision which it would be possible to secure, might ultimately make shoes for prison officers and their families, and possibly, in time, for other State services. Recently the manufacture of uniform boots for officers has been resumed experimentally.

The geographical position of the two convict prisons at Parkhurst and Dartmoor makes it difficult to organize industries economically at these prisons, and the introduction of minor manufactures such as we have referred to in paragraph 148 might be considered.

It should be an important part of the duties of the proposed Industrial Commissioner to review from time to time the available workshop and storage accommodation, and to see that it is utilized to the best advantage. He should also take steps to secure improved conditions in regard to seating, lighting, heating and ventilation in prison workshops, particularly seating.

Classification of prisoners.

153. If our proposals for the concentration of industries are adopted it is essential that there should be a continuance and extension of the policy of appropriating certain prisons to certain classes of prisoner. By this means a more homogeneous population will be obtained and the difficulties caused by the classification of prisoners avoided or at least reduced. .

On the other hand frequent changes of classification or transfer of prisoners are bound to interfere with the smooth running of prison industries, and so far as possible a continuity of policy in this matter should be aimed at in the interests of industrial efficiency.

154. Any scheme for the collection of certain types of prisoner in particular prisons must of course involve the removal of a certain number of prisoners to considerable distances from their homes, and may in this way interfere with their opportunities of receiving visits from their relatives and friends.

Experience at Wakefield suggests, however, that the difficulties are outweighed by the advantages of proper classification, and we do not think they should prevent further experiment in this direction.

The addition which has been made in the new Rules for Prisons in England and Wales to the ordinary prisoner's facilities for sending and receiving letters should do something to alleviate any hardship that might arise by reason of the removal of prisoners to special establishments at a distance from their homes.

155. We recommend on industrial grounds what we understand the Commissioners think desirable on general grounds, namely, that the statutory varieties of imprisonment should be abolished and that the classification and mode of employment of prisoners should be clearly placed by law in the hands of the Prison Authorities, subject to a statutory requirement that they should classify prisoners in such a way as to reduce contamination to a minimum. Industrial considerations must not be allowed to interfere with the principle that the better prisoners ought to be kept apart from the worse and the younger from the older. We express no view on the desirability or otherwise of retaining some substitute for the present First Division.

Restoration of the eight-hour associated labour day.

156. Changes in accommodation and equipment, to be justifiable, must be accompanied by steps which will bring the output of prison labour into closer relationship with that of the outside workshop.

In the English prisons a necessary preliminary is a return to a longer associated working day. In the Scottish prisons the period of associated labour has never been reduced and a day of approximately $7\frac{1}{2}$ hours continues to be worked. The reduction

of the associated working day was imposed on the English prisons in 1931 as their contribution to the scheme of national economy, though the Prison Commissioners pointed out the serious effect that such a course was bound to have on the prisons both from the general and the industrial point of view. The result of the change has been to reduce the effective day of associated labour to under five hours except at the Borstal Institutions, at certain specialized prisons such as Wakefield, and for certain parties in other prisons. For example, the actual period of associated work in the shoemakers' and tailors' shops at Dartmoor is $23\frac{1}{2}$ hours a week; in the tailors' shop at Pentonville different parties work respectively $24\frac{1}{4}$ hours and $33\frac{1}{2}$ hours a week, while in the basket shop the hours are $24\frac{1}{4}$; at Birmingham and Holloway the average hours for all associated labour are 26 and $25\frac{1}{2}$ a week respectively. These are the hours of actual work, excluding time spent in going to and from the shops and time lost owing to various interruptions such as exercise, shaving, visits, etc.

157. It is a truism to observe that the simplest road to economy in the administration of the prisons is to confine prisoners to their cells and to have no work in association; that would be a retrograde step and the decision taken in 1931 to reduce the hours of work in association was one which is, we think, deplorable from every point of view except finance. We strongly recommend that the staff necessary to enable the Prison Commissioners to re-establish the old associated working day of nominally eight hours should be authorized as soon as possible. We understand that the day did not at any time amount to eight hours actual work in association, since allowance had to be made for the time necessary to bring prisoners to and from their work.

158. In this connection our attention has been drawn to various causes which lead to interruption of the working day—divine service, medical examination, exercise, visits, haircutting, shaving, bathing, applications, and so on. We realize that shortage of staff or considerations of discipline may make it difficult to compress such activities into the evening hours, and that to do so may interfere with the educational programmes which are arranged for that period of the day. We should deprecate any rearrangement which might interfere with this valuable educational work, but the matter is one which requires careful consideration with a view to the elimination to the greatest possible extent of all unnecessary interruptions of associated work. In particular we suggest that wherever possible the week-day service should be held during the evening and not as at present during labour hours.

The experimental introduction of a Prison news sheet at Parkhurst in place of the weekly reading of the news has, apart from other advantages, made possible an extra half-hour's work on Saturdays. For this reason, as well as on general grounds, an extension of the scheme is to be desired.

159. While we should like to see an actual eight-hour working day established, we recognize that as the prison officer also works only an eight-hour day the cost in supervision of such an arrangement might be out of all proportion to the value of the short extra period of labour which could be gained.

Other matters affecting employment.

160. We have received some evidence that, at any rate in certain prisons, prisoners are from time to time transferred from one form of employment to another on other than purely industrial grounds. In some cases there may be good reason for such changes. For instance convicts serving long sentences are liable to become depressed or restive if kept for years at one type of occupation and a change may be reasonable. Again it may be necessary, if a Governor suspects certain prisoners are plotting mischief, to separate them and the consequence may be that one workshop loses a well-trained and experienced worker and another working party acquires a recruit who knows nothing of the work. It is, we understand, the practice to limit employment on work which offers special opportunities for escape to prisoners who have only a small part of their sentence to run and have therefore little to gain by escape. Considerations of health or discipline may also justify a change in a prisoner's employment, but as such changes are bound to react adversely on the general organization of employment, they should, we think, be limited as far as possible, and should, only be permitted when it is clear that some definite advantage from the point of view of prison administration is to be gained thereby.

161. We do not suggest any alteration in the practice of employing labourers on heavy outdoor work for the last few weeks of their sentence so as to prepare them physically for the work they are likely to undertake on discharge.

162. One other matter may be referred to here. In any general prison it is desirable that as far as possible no prisoner who is serving a considerable sentence or who for other reasons can usefully be employed on better work should be employed in the cleaning or other domestic work of the prison. The existing rule that this work should usually be allotted to unskilled prisoners serving short sentences is right, subject to the recommendation in paragraph 171 below.

Inducements to labour—payment of prisoners.

163. Practically every witness has expressed the view, with which from our personal observations we are able to agree, that the majority of prisoners do not work as hard in prison as they would be expected to do in outside employment. The prison population in general is, in fact, adept at wasting time unobtrusively, and inducements to additional work are much needed. When there is a big task to be done in some prison workshop and there is pressure to complete it by a certain date, many instructors are remarkably

successful in stimulating prisoners to work with a will, but in general prisoners show no desire to do more than will avoid a report for idleness. There is general agreement that the marks system which was expected to serve as the necessary stimulus to industry has become more or less automatic, and amounts to little more than the crediting of marks to every prisoner who reaches a certain minimum standard of conduct and industry.

Some of the reasons for this failure are

(a) the Instructors' difficulty in awarding marks fairly owing to the wide disparity in the capacity of prisoners;

(b) the fact that although there are standard tasks for certain employments, the hours of labour at all prisons are not identical;

(c) the tasks referred to at (b) are more or less obsolete, having been framed in 1897 when practically all work was done by hand.

(d) the absence of a regular supply of work militates against a consistent enforcement of tasks.

164. As a substitute for the marks system the Commissioners have experimented with schemes of payment at Wakefield and Lowdham with the object of speeding up work. In both places the population is specially selected, and experience alone would show whether the experiment could successfully be extended to other classes of the prison population. Two causes have, we understand, prevented any general extension of a wages scheme to other establishments, viz., the cost of payment and the lack of work.

165. Lack of work is the more serious difficulty. It is clearly no use speeding up work if the result is the earlier completion of all available orders and consequent inevitable idleness of prisoners, and any extension of a system of payment is therefore dependent on the securing of a steady and sufficient volume of work.

166. Many of the unofficial witnesses suggested to us that a system of wages comparable to those paid in outside employments should be instituted and that out of such wages prisoners should be required to pay the cost of their maintenance and possibly something towards the support of their dependants. To such a proposal we see many objections. Most prisoners are unskilled and during their period of learning could not economically be paid wages or at any rate such wages as would cover the cost of their maintenance. The suggestion that the practice of certain foreign countries should be adopted and that prisoners should be provided with the bare necessities of existence and should be made to depend on their own exertions for any additions to the minimum, is not one which would commend itself to British ideas. At present prisoners generally speaking receive only such food, clothing, etc., as are considered necessary for the maintenance of health, and we could not recommend any lowering of the standard.

We have made enquiries into the practice of certain European countries, and we find that although in theory wages are paid on the basis of outside scales, in practice the prisoner receives only a much smaller sum arbitrarily fixed by the prison authority. We conclude therefore that it is impracticable to introduce any system of payment based on outside wages.

167. We are greatly impressed by the good results of the experimental systems of payment in force at Wakefield and Lowdham and we think that the extension of a system of payment to other establishments on similar lines should be made. There is room for continued experiment in details, and we do not think it possible to lay down any scheme applicable to all circumstances.

Broadly we advocate a system by which, assuming a sufficiency of work to be available, payment of prisoners should be generally introduced. Payment should be made only if a minimum standard of output of adequate quality is reached and should increase as output of approved quality is increased over the minimum.

As regards the use which prisoners should be allowed to make of their earnings, experience of the old system of gratuities and of the payments made to prisoners serving sentences of preventive detention shows conclusively the evil results of allowing prisoners to accumulate a sum of which they can dispose freely on discharge and we recommend that any earnings, if not spent during the currency of the sentence, should be handed over to the Prisoners' Aid Society to be used for the benefit of the prisoner on release.

168. We have considered whether extra remission of sentence in return for more than a fixed quota of work would be a suitable inducement but we do not recommend the adoption of this plan. Apart from other objections such an arrangement would favour the skilled as against the unskilled prisoner and the latter might well be the more deserving of the two.

It would indeed be difficult to justify a system by which a confirmed criminal was let loose to resume his war against society earlier than a first offender merely because the former happened to possess a special skill (possibly acquired in previous sentences) in the employment to which he was set during his sentence.

Basis of payment—Measurement of Work.

169. The success of any scheme of payment depends upon a satisfactory method of measuring work done, and it is evident that some types of work lend themselves more readily than others to such treatment.

In some cases the employment of prisoners in groups and a system of payment based on the collective output of the group may be found desirable. Such a system has been found effective in other walks of life by bringing the corporate opinion of the group to bear on workers who are inclined to be lazy or inattentive.

In other cases the work may not be capable of measurement, but it may be possible to regulate effectively the number of men employed on a particular job., e.g. in the kitchen, and to make payment dependent upon the performance of the work by not more than a prescribed number of prisoners.

As regards much of the work done in prison, however, a system of measurement of work done should be perfectly feasible.

170. In outside industry a great deal has been done in recent years by the development of scientific methods of measurement of work and by other means to improve methods of working and to reach a fuller understanding of the capacity and needs of workers in different industries. We think that valuable assistance would be derived by the Prison Authorities if a selected officer were seconded for, say, 12 months for the purpose of studying and receiving instruction in modern methods of work measurement in outside industry where such methods are in operation. On his return this officer should be given the duty of investigating existing methods of measurement at Wakefield and Lowdham and of advising the Authorities on their improvement and extension to other prisons and occupations. Any elaborate system would be out of place in prisons and would lead to much unnecessary and unremunerative clerical work, but with expert advice it should be possible to improve on existing methods and to devise new methods, and we believe that by steps of this kind such an understanding of the capacity of prisoners would be obtained as would lead to a considerable improvement in the speed of working and consequently to a great improvement in output. The possibility of employing selected prisoners on the clerical and statistical work involved seems to us worthy of consideration.

171. But whatever method may be adopted it is essential that payment should not become automatic and that it should be rigidly based either on actual measurement of output or on a careful assessment of the prisoners' activity. It should only be made if a minimum standard of performance has been reached. Any case of failure to reach the standard output should be brought to the notice of the Governor.

In any such scheme we think it is essential to have an unpaid party, the members of which receive no payment and can only obtain payment when by industry and conduct they have shown themselves fit for promotion to a paid party. Relegation to the party would form a useful form of punishment for the idle and ill-conducted.

172. The moral effect of such a system of measurement or assessment of work on prisoners and instructors alike would, we are convinced, be of the greatest importance and the establishment of the system would also have the added advantage of enabling comparisons to be made between the work and efficiency of different prisons, a comparison which should be a useful lever in bringing the less efficient establishments up to the level of the more efficient.

Employment of Women.

173. In many ways the problem of women's work in prisons is much simpler than with regard to men. The numbers dealt with are far smaller (800 as compared with 12,000). On the whole women are more accustomed to sedentary work than men and go to pieces less under it. Moreover, much prison equipment (in particular stockings, and clothes for officers, prisoners and Borstal inmates) can be profitably made by women without a long period of training or expensive plant. Mending and laundry also give a large amount of work. For Young Prisoners something more nearly approaching ordinary housework than is possible in a prison can be had in the officers' quarters. A class in cookery is held for Young Prisoners in Holloway Prison.

Nevertheless we doubt whether the organization of labour in women's prisons can be regarded as entirely satisfactory. The same amount of effort could be made far more productive with better equipment. Power sewing machines are to be found in very few prisons, and in almost all cases the laundry machinery belongs to a different epoch from that in use in commercial establishments. This has several disadvantages. Washing for the public services is a very suitable service for prisons to render. It is still undertaken to some extent, particularly in Scotland, but when the number of prisoners fell very markedly in Holloway Prison some years ago Post Office and other Government work was given up. It can only be undertaken again if proper machinery is installed.

174. Modern machinery obviates the somewhat messy and unhealthy work of the wash tub; it also demands a completely different speed and adroitness from the old hand washing. Whilst it would be impossible to introduce the full range of complicated laundry machines into a prison, enough power machinery should in our view be obtained to make the women's work remunerative, and to give the released prisoner some hope of being able to obtain work of this class, where speed is absolutely essential.

In the same way we think that the use of power for sewing machinery should be made general, where sewing is treated as a prison manufacture on a considerable scale; there is said to be a good demand for women able to work power sewing machines. The use of the hand machine must remain, of course, an essential part of general domestic training for young women and girls. For we regard it as evident that, as regards laundry work, cooking and sewing, the need of training younger prisoners—in fact all prisoners who are capable of becoming good workers—in such a way that they may be able to take a situation outside or to improve the conditions in their own home must not be lost sight of in the effort to make their work profitable. In all these three housecraft subjects (cooking, laundry and sewing) instruction and practice in work of a better class than can be justified for prison use should be given to a greater extent than at present.

175. This will probably involve the extension of work for private customers. Already in Scotland some high-grade private laundry work is done. But Army or Local Authorities' hospitals might supply work of this better class. Here, as in the case of the men, trade teachers of a really high grade are essential. It is very much to be hoped that at the earliest possible date all prisoners except those on remand may be removed from the fastnesses of Holloway Prison to an institution in the outskirts of London where outdoor work could be added to the other occupations. In such an institution the prisoners might be grouped in houses sufficiently small and un-institution like to give experience in the economic and resourceful running of small houses.

The awakening of an interest in their homes, the birth of house-pride, will be one of the best ways of giving a new hope in life to some at least of our women prisoners.

176. At the same time we recognize that many petty offenders break the law just because they are misfits at the work they have been set to. The assumption that every woman is a housewife at heart is much too readily made, and some women will do better in something akin to factory work than household tasks.

For these women the problems are to give to the prison shops something at least of the character of an ordinary workroom and to help them to a place on discharge.

177. We realize that there will remain (unless and until some other method of treatment than that of repeated short sentences is adopted) a considerable body of elderly women incompetent for any but the simplest tasks. Perhaps these may be further varied in character. The knitting of gloves already undertaken in Scottish prisons might be extended to the making of gloves for the police and of housemaids' gloves for Government offices. There are also found women of good ability who might perhaps be employed to help in the clerical and statistical work involved by the introduction of the scheme of payment which we have described, and which is quite as desirable for raising the standard of women's work as for men.

Instructors.

178. If prison industries are to be improved and modernized, the instructors should as far as possible be skilled men who have had experience of the trade before entering the Prison Service. In recent years a number of skilled instructors has been engaged and their influence is reflected in the quality of the work turned out of the shops of which they are in charge. There are, however, many instructors who have learned what they know of their trade in the prison workshops, and we are informed that they have given willing and capable service, often under difficult conditions. But the use of the prison-trained instructor is bound to result in the continuance of antiquated methods and a low standard of skill in

the shops. We are satisfied that in some of the skilled industries a more efficient type of instructor is required, and we recommend that fully qualified instructors should gradually be introduced.

They should be men who have acquired a thorough technical knowledge of the trade in outside employment and since they will be required to handle men and to impart their knowledge we think that only men who have had experience as foremen are likely to be suitable. The duties of a prison instructor are more difficult than those of an instructor in an outside shop for he has to deal with untrained and, on the whole, poor grade labour, and he must be a disciplinarian—alive to the possibility of difficulties in a prison shop which would not arise outside.

We do not think it desirable that they should be appointed to the Established Staff. The present system of unestablished Civilian Instructors appears, on the whole, to work well, and we recommend that it should be extended to cover future requirements. The Instructors should be employed solely as instructors and should not be required to wear uniform.

179. We do not feel able to suggest any definite ratio of instructors to prisoners under instruction which would be generally applicable; but the special difficulties of prison instruction, and in particular the lower average mental level of the prison population, warrant a higher proportion of instructors to pupils than is required outside. It is important that the number of instructors should be sufficient to enable them to devote adequate time to the instruction of the prisoners under their care.

180. The age of recruitment should usually be from 30 to 40, though some elasticity might be retained in this matter in the case of a specially suitable candidate.

181. If civilian instructors are retained for a prolonged period in the prison service there is, of course, a danger that they may in time fall into a rut and lose touch with outside methods and developments. To guard against this we think it is important that they should be given facilities for keeping themselves informed of modern developments in their trade and that they should be required to do so.

182. The wages we suggest are, for men £3 10s. a week rising to £4 10s., and for women £2 a week rising to £3, inclusive. This wage compares favourably with the wages earned by foremen in outside industry and should be sufficient to attract a suitable type of candidate.

183. As regards the existing established instructors it appears that their payment is dependent in some cases on the average number of prisoners employed in the particular shop. Such a system is open to criticism, and we suggest that an examination of workshops should be made with a view to establishing a new basis of payment related to the importance and difficulty of the work in

each case. In arriving at such a basis consideration should be given to the size of the particular shop, but payment should not bear any directly ascertained relation to the number of prisoners under instruction.

184. The above recommendations relate solely to instructors in the various manufacturing trades. In the case of building work other considerations apply. Here it is essential that the instructor should also be a Discipline Officer, since he may, and generally will, have to supervise prisoners in the open without the assistance of a Discipline Officer. For this reason we recommend a continuance of the present practice by which a certain number of experienced tradesmen are enlisted as Discipline Officers, and after a period of training in that capacity, are transferred to the Works Branch provided they pass a qualifying examination.

Industrial Managers.

185. If our recommendations are adopted, the industrial work of a large prison will, we hope, approximate more nearly to the conditions of the outside world. It will certainly require more time and greater care in supervision than the Stewards can give. We recommend therefore that at all large prisons an Industrial Manager should be appointed whose duty it should be to supervise the instructors on industrial work and to organize and supervise all employment in the prison with the exception of building and maintenance work, with special reference to the working of any system of measurement of and payment for work, and to be responsible for the proper carrying out of all orders received, the inspection of raw materials and the inspection of and delivery to the Steward of the finished goods.

186. He should take over from the Steward the employment side of the latter's work and be responsible, through the Governor, to the Industrial Commissioner. The Steward should continue, as at present, to be in charge of all prison stores, and the Industrial Manager should obtain all raw materials and tools from him and deliver to him all finished products. We have considered whether the Industrial Manager should be responsible also for the works branch of the prison, but we do not recommend this. This work should remain under the control of the Surveyor and of his representative in the prison, the Works Officer. We think that there may be an advantage in creating two grades of manager according to the size of the prison; but at the smaller prisons the creation of an additional post would not be warranted and we recommend that the Steward should continue, as at present, to be personally responsible for the conduct of the industries of the prison.

187. We recommend for these posts men who have had a thorough general training in outside industry as general foremen

with special experience in the industries predominant in given prisons. Senior instructors of the type we have recommended should be regarded as eligible for promotion to Industrial Manager.

188. We recommend that the Class I Industrial Manager should be paid a salary of from £350 to £400 a year inclusive, and the Class II Manager a salary of £300 to £350 inclusive. For women the pay should be from £225 to £275 inclusive.

Organization of the Prison Commission: England and Wales.

189. The changes we have recommended will involve organization and supervision from Headquarters, and we regard it as essential that the staff of the Commissioners should be strengthened by the appointment of an Industrial Commissioner with the special duty of re-organizing and supervising all prison industries.

190. There is not, either among the Prison Commissioners or the Assistant Commissioners, an officer who is charged directly with the duty of organizing and administering prison industries. The Chairman is and must be concerned with prison administration taken as a broad general problem and cannot give detailed attention to any single aspect of prison government. Of the remaining two Commissioners, one, speaking generally, deals with matters of discipline, general education and welfare in the prisons, and the other is concerned with the medical aspect of prison problems. A post on the Board for a Commissioner to supervise industries, which has been authorized, has never been filled.

191. After a great deal of consideration of the question we have come to the conclusion that the needs would not be adequately met by the appointment of a Director of Prison Industries who would not be a Commissioner, even though he might, by his freedom from the primary responsibilities of the Commissioners, be able to represent freely and strongly the needs of prison industries. We think that only by having a seat on the Board could the Director of Prison Industries secure a proper recognition by the Authorities of the importance of the work he is to undertake, and exercise fully the authority we think he should have.

We therefore strongly recommend that the vacant commissioner-ship should be filled by the appointment of a Commissioner charged specially with the organization and supervision of prison industries.

192. The man selected for the post must have expert knowledge of factory management and organization, either within or outside Government service, but he must at the same time have sufficient sympathy with the needs and difficulties of the Prison service to enable him to co-operate with the Commissioners, and with the Prison Governors, and, in organizing industries, to give due regard to general policy in the treatment of offenders.

He should be allowed to call upon expert advice of a temporary or permanent character as occasion demands.

193. The duties which he will perform in relation to prisons in England and Wales are of importance also in relation to Scottish prisons, but the work in Scotland is not of sufficient dimensions to warrant a separate appointment and we recommend that the Industrial Commissioner be appointed Industrial Adviser to the Scottish Prison Department, a proportion of his salary being paid from the Vote of the Prisons Department for Scotland.

He would be responsible in consultation with the purchasing departments for the division of Government orders as between English and Scottish Prisons, and, when such a course was desirable, would arrange for joint contracts for the purchase of materials and for facilities which would enable the Scottish Department to obtain supplies in suitable cases under the Contracts of other Departments. In general, he would furnish the Scottish Department with all available information which would be likely to assist them in the efficient administration of prison industries.

Attitude of Prison Governors.

194. Just as at headquarters the problems of the industrial side of prison life appear to have fallen into the background, so also the majority of the Prison Governors appear to have regarded the matter of the employment of prisoners as one of minor importance. Prison Governors are primarily concerned, and rightly so, with the safeguarding of prisoners committed to their charge, but while we recognize fully the heavy responsibility of the Governor in matters of safe custody and discipline we think there is room in many cases for a greater interest in industrial training. We have found some Governors pessimistic, even obdurately pessimistic, in regard to improvements in the organization of prison industries, but there are other Governors who are most active in seeking improvements on the industrial side of prison life and these are not, so far as we can judge, the least successful in maintaining discipline and safeguarding the prisoners in their charge. The whole body of Governors must be brought to realize the paramount importance of the proper employment of prisoners, not simply as an end in itself but as a feature in discipline and moral and physical regeneration, and should be encouraged to devote a greater proportion of their energy and ability to the solution of the many industrial difficulties which exist. The active goodwill of the Prison Governors is needed before any real improvement can be hoped for.

Recommendations as regards Borstal Institutions.

We proceed now to make certain recommendations with special reference to Borstal Institutions but the recommendations contained in paragraphs 143-7 and 150-2 apply equally to these Institutions.

Need of better understanding of System by the Courts.

195. In the first place we think some reference should be made to the unfortunate effect of certain remarks which are frequently made by the Courts in passing sentences of Borstal Detention. It is quite common for the boy who is sentenced to Borstal Detention to be told that he will not be sent to prison but that he will be sent straight to an institution where he will be taught a useful trade. When following such remarks the boy finds himself in Wormwood Scrubs Prison he is not unnaturally resentful and not in the best frame of mind to enter upon his training. His friends too feel a sense of grievance, and both they and the boy are further disillusioned to find that he does not immediately take his place in a trade party.

We hope some steps may be taken to place the facts before the Courts so that such misleading promises may be avoided, and at the same time we hope that it may be possible to suggest, or if an opportunity occurs to require by statute, that in passing a sentence of Borstal Detention the Court should at the same time give the offender clearly to understand that the sentence carries with it supervision for 12 months beyond the actual period of the Borstal sentence.

There is evidence that many young offenders do not realize this until they arrive at the Borstal Institution, and that the realization at this late stage of the full effect of a Borstal sentence often produces a keen sense of injustice and seriously hampers the work of reformation which the Borstal Authorities seek to carry out.

Delay in starting training.

196. We have referred in paragraphs 94 and 96 to the length of time which elapses before a boy reaches the Borstal Institution in which he is to serve his sentence. As regards the delays before sentence, this is a matter of the law and practice of the Courts, and as such outside our terms of reference, but we think it right to draw attention to the extent to which this delay detracts from the ideals of training under the Borstal System. If, as part of any general revision of criminal procedure, something could be done to limit this delay it would be of the greatest value in the treatment of these boys. As regards the delay at Wormwood Scrubs after sentence, we recognize that some time is required for, and can usefully be spent in, inquiries and examination before the Commissioners decide which is the Borstal Institution most suitable to the needs of a particular offender. We are glad to learn that the time of detention has been greatly reduced of late months as more accommodation has been available, and we think that it is most desirable that this reduction should be maintained and that normally a boy should not spend more than one month at Wormwood Scrubs while awaiting allocation to a Borstal Institution. This period of waiting should be passed not in a prison but, when financial conditions allow of its being built or acquired, in a separate

institution in London, so that from the beginning the boy might be removed from the prison atmosphere to that of a Borstal Institution. This would have the advantage that the general training to which we refer in the next paragraph could commence at an earlier stage in the boy's sentence and so make it possible to expedite the posting of suitable boys to trade parties for definite industrial training.

197. When the boy finally reaches the Borstal Institution he is at first employed on cleaning duties, and then for a time on labouring work before he is drafted, if suitable, into a trade party. The practice in this matter is stated in detail in paragraph 98. We understand that most Borstal Governors attach great importance to this preliminary period both as giving time for the boy to settle down in his new surroundings, and for them to form conclusions as to his character and the form of training most likely to be suitable to his needs, and also as fulfilling a distinct purpose in the social and physical training of the boy. Many of these boys have never been acquainted with discipline or indeed with any of the ordinary habits and requirements of civilized life, and a period of elementary training on this side is necessary before they can, with any hope of success, be drafted to a trade party. We are impressed by the force with which this view was urged upon us by those whose experience of the needs of the Borstal boys entitles them to speak with authority, but we cannot ignore the extent to which the period of unskilled employment reduces the time available for training the inmate in some occupation likely to be useful to him on discharge.

Industrial training.

198. It is true that in many cases labouring work is the most suitable form of training and that in which there is the greatest opportunity of finding employment on release; but, in cases where a boy seems likely to profit by a training in some more skilled form of employment, we think it is important that at an early stage in his sentence he should be transferred to a trade party, so that he may be under training for as long a period as possible. The time of actual industrial training is all too short to enable the boy to reach any high degree of skill, and we should like to see the experiment of transferring selected boys to the shops at an earlier stage continued and extended. We understand that, even now, the practice is by no means rigid, and that in certain cases and in certain institutions the preliminary period is sometimes considerably reduced. It should not become a matter of routine; but every case should be considered on its merits with a view to reducing the delay wherever possible.

Shortage of workshop accommodation and equipment is to some extent the cause of the delay in drafting boys into trade parties, and the improvements in workshops and equipment which we have suggested should enable these delays to be reduced.

199. In this connection we think the question of reducing to the lowest possible limits the numbers of boys employed on unskilled domestic work, such as cleaning, should be considered; and that generally there should be a regular review of the number of boys employed on any given operation so as to avoid the employment of more than is absolutely necessary for the proper performance of the work.

The employment of an excessive number of workers on any given job is bound to give the boys a wrong impression of what is likely to be required of them after release and in this way seriously to prejudice their chances of making good in the outside world.

200. We may refer at this stage to an interesting experiment which was commenced by the Institute of Industrial Psychology some two years ago and is still in progress. Some 400 Borstal boys were subjected to a series of intelligence and other tests, as a result of which recommendations were made as to the trade parties to which they might most suitably be posted. The experiment is as yet incomplete, but we understand there is already evidence that the allocation of boys so recommended has been more satisfactory than that of boys who have not been subjected to the tests. The results achieved seem to us sufficiently promising to warrant further development of the scheme, and we recommend that a small number of Housemasters, or Assistant Housemasters, say one from each Institution, should be seconded for a period of three months' training with the Institute, with a view to their undertaking the regular examination of boys as received in their Institutions and advising the Governor as to the employments to which they may most suitably be posted. Detailed records of such examinations and recommendations should be kept and compared with the subsequent progress of the boys concerned.

201. We noted that for advanced training in a few cases Borstal boys are allowed to attend technical classes at neighbouring institutions. We recommend that either in this way or by industrial lectures and classes in the Borstal Institutions facilities should be given to enable promising boys to receive fuller training in trades which will be of use to them on release.

Concentration of Industries.

202. The distribution of industries in small parties over numerous prisons to which we have referred is to be found also, if to a lesser extent, in the Borstal Institutions, and in the interests both of training and of industrial efficiency we think that steps should be taken to eliminate these small shops and to arrange industries in larger shops. Some variety is necessary to provide suitable opportunities for different types of boy in each Institution, but we think that it should be sufficient if, in addition to farming, only two other industries were provided at each Institution. This concentration would enable more varied work to be done in each

industry and would allow of arrangements to which we attach great importance, viz., the grading of work so as to provide for a learners' and a more advanced party in each industry.

Larger shops are needed than those at present in use, some of which are too small for efficiency, whether of training or production. In cases where larger shops cannot be made available we suggest that two shops might be used for the same industry graded for learners and for more advanced workers.

In this connection we must refer, as in the case of the prisons, to the inadequacy of the storage accommodation in the Borstal Institutions. The use of part of the workshops as store-rooms reduces the space available for employment and training, and the question of providing adequate storage space for raw materials and manufactured articles is one which requires urgent consideration.

Materials for training.

203. We recommend that a reasonable amount of material should be provided for the purpose of training, but adequate checks must be maintained on such material in order to ensure that it is used for no improper purpose.

Girls in Borstal.

204. We do not think any great change in the scheme of training at Aylesbury is necessary. It seems to us to be well adapted to the needs of the girls detained there, and we understand that, in fact, the great majority find no difficulty in obtaining and keeping situations in domestic service. As regards the minority who are not suitable for such service, the existing arrangements by which girls receive training in the making of their liberty clothes and in the evening dressmaking classes seem to us very valuable, and we recommend their continuance and, if possible, extension.

At another institution a small group of Borstal girls is chiefly engaged in domestic work for the male prisoners confined in another part of the same establishment. For these men, about eight times their number, the girls do shirt making, all mending, washing, cooking and washing up. This work, which amounts to domestic drudgery, is not a satisfactory form of training for these girls, however suitable it might be for older women. We think that Borstal girls should be employed on domestic work better calculated to afford them training for employment on release.

Payment of Borstal Inmates.

205. We need not refer in detail to the question of payment as this has already been fully discussed in our remarks on the payment of prisoners. We need only repeat what we have said in paragraph 167, that we are greatly impressed by the success of the experimental scheme of payment at Lowdham and that we strongly recommend the extension of some scheme of payment to all the Borstal Institutions so soon as a sufficiency of work is available.

Borstal training and Apprenticeship.

206. Many witnesses have suggested that an endeavour should be made to secure the recognition by the Craft Unions of a period spent in training in a Borstal Institution as the equivalent of an equal or a shorter period in free apprenticeship.

Apart from the fact that many boys on release prefer to take up work as a labourer rather than as an improver because the wages are better, we feel some doubt whether a period spent in a Borstal Institution shop could properly be regarded as a substitute for a similar or a shorter period in outside industry, but we have consulted the General Council of the Trades Union Congress, and have received the following reply :—

“ In regard to the question as to whether a period of training served by a man in a Prison or Borstal Institution should, under certain well defined conditions, be regarded as equivalent to a like period of apprenticeship,” “ I have to say that this matter has now been considered by the General Council of the Trades Union Congress, and they have directed me to write and explain their difficulty in giving you a specific answer on the subject.

“ The Unions which are affiliated to the Trades Union Congress have complete autonomy in respect of the conditions under which their members are employed. Many of the unions have definite agreements with the employers’ organizations in respect of apprenticeship, and these agreements vary very considerably from trade to trade.

“ A number of the unions have had experience in regard to accepting into industry ex-servicemen who were trained under special arrangements to which these unions were parties, and which prescribed considerable variations from the normal apprenticeship undertaken by the members of the unions.

“ The experience obtained under these schemes from a trade union point of view, has, generally speaking, not been such as would encourage unions to make further departures in their rules and accept as skilled workers persons who have not been trained under normal apprenticeship conditions.

“ Your Committee will, no doubt, fully appreciate the special difficulties in regard to accepting a period of training served in a prison or Borstal Institution, as equivalent to a like period of apprenticeship. It is difficult to see how facilities for training such men could be sufficiently adequate as to enable them to become fully skilled men, particularly at the present time when there is such a large amount of unemployment in practically every one of the skilled trades. Such men would stand no reasonable chance of securing employment as skilled workers under trade union rates and conditions.

“ This reply is necessarily general in character because, as has already been stated, the matter is one which can be definitely dealt with only by the individual unions in the trades or industries likely to be affected.”

The Scottish Trades Union Congress General Council, who were also consulted, replied that this was a matter over which they had no control and suggested that any proposals affecting particular trades should be made to the Trade Unions who, because of their existing agreements in industry, are best able to determine how far any proposals may be met.

Enquiries were made of three unions, and the following extracts sufficiently illustrate their attitude :—

Amalgamated Union of Building Trade Workers of Great Britain and Ireland.

“ My Executive Council feels very strongly that it is grossly unfair that honest lads and good citizens should be deprived of the opportunity of training and employment, whilst it is proposed that persons who have committed offences against the law and community are assisted in this connection, and in all the circumstances my Council is unable to see its way to collaborate with your Committee on the lines suggested in your communication.”

Amalgamated Society of Woodworkers.

“ I would like to point out that for the past two years the average weekly number of unemployed members of this Society has been 15,000 at which figure it continues to remain, and during the past twenty-four months, the Organisation has paid out in Society Unemployment Benefit £380,000. In view of these facts, and our previous experience of Agreements entered into with Government Departments in connection with training of dilutees for the wood-working industry, my Council is not prepared to accept any scheme whereby those who have not served their apprenticeship as members of this Organisation should be in a position at a later date to compete with our members, and, as is usual in such cases, to compete by working for less than the recognised standard rates.”

Amalgamated Engineering Union.

“ Your letter dated the 4th instant, having reference to the period of training served by a man in a Prison or Borstal Institution being regarded as equivalent to a like period of apprenticeship in Industrial Establishments, together with copy of letter addressed by you to Mr. W. M. Citrine, General Secretary, Trade Union Congress General Council, have been considered by my Executive Council.

“ They direct me to inform you that they could not agree to such a proposal, and I am further to add that having regard to the present number of unemployed workers in the Engineering

Industry, there is no necessity for training men for the Engineering Trade, as there is abundant proof that the industry is not capable of absorbing those who have already served their apprenticeship thereto.

“ It may assist you to appreciate the point of view of my Council more clearly when I state that at the present time this Union alone has over 40,000 members unemployed and have never had less than that number during the whole of 1932 and up to the present day.”

In these circumstances it does not seem that any useful purpose would be served by pursuing the question.

Prisoners' statements.

We obtained from selected prisoners most interesting and useful statements in regard to employment during imprisonment and after release : and extracts are printed in Appendix II.

Financial.

207. A direct financial return for prison labour is not the primary object of our proposals.

The adoption of our recommendations will involve a considerable increase in the gross expenditure on the prison service. The main items of expense which would be occasioned are very approximately as follows :—

	£
1. One additional Commissioner (para. 189)	1,250
2. Industrial Managers (para. 185)	7,750
3. Additional instructors (para. 178)	3,000
4. Additional staff to permit of reversion to 8 hour day (para. 157)	22,000
5. Payments to prisoners allow for 5,000 at say £2 per annum (9d. a week)	10,000
6. Sundry other expenses including escorts	6,000
	<hr/>
	£50,000
	<hr/>

All of this is annual recurring expenditure and there would be a continuance of capital expenditure at at least the current rates for additional workshops, machinery of a modern kind (but generally simple and therefore not expensive) and quarters for new Staff. A great part of this expenditure arises out of our recommendations for improving the general conditions of prisoners' employment and it would not be right to debit the whole expense involved against the productive industries of the prisons.

208. Expenditure would of course increase to the maximum extent only as reorganization became effective and as additional

work became available, and we should expect the expenditure to be offset in two principal ways.

1. If as we believe, an improvement in the efficiency of prison labour and prison instruction is urgently necessary to enable the prisons to serve their purpose in fitting the prisoner to resume a respectable and honest life on release, an even moderate success in this direction will be reflected in very considerable indirect savings in the work of the police, the courts, and the prisons, a saving which may properly be set against the cost of our recommendations.

2. There ought to be an additional return in the form of extra output and improved quality of work done in the prisons, and, to the extent that there is additional output of manufactured articles for sale there should be an actual cash return if, as we have suggested in paragraph 135, a fair market price is paid for all prison-made goods by the Government Departments. It must be remembered that we contemplate a greater measure of training in suitable cases which may to some extent curtail the return from the work of those prisoners who might be expected to be the best workers. Moreover all available building work is already allotted to the prisons, while the demand for goods for prison use is dependent upon the size of the prison population over which the Prison Authorities have no control. In these circumstances any steps to secure an increased return for prison labour must be directed to the increase of sales of goods and farm produce. We have shown earlier in this report (paragraph 88) that allowing credit for the contributions made by the prison population in building work in the prisons and in the supply of farm produce, in manufactured articles for their own use and for sales to Government Departments, &c., the probable valuation of the labour of all prisoners, except those engaged in domestic services on which we have placed no valuation, amounts on the average to £82,500 per annum. Provided additional work can be obtained, we think it ought to be possible to increase substantially the return for prison labour as a result of improved methods and organization, and it is not unreasonable to hope that an additional return, which would go far to meet the additional costs we contemplate, would be attainable. The increase cannot be looked for immediately and we realize that a great deal of hard and continuous work would be necessary to achieve it.

Record of work.

209. We consider it is necessary that complete records of the occupation of prisoners in industry should be available and that basic information regarding consumption of material should be maintained, in order that adequate information for disciplinary control in the prisons should be in the hands of those responsible,

and in order that costing studies may be made. We do not advocate the introduction of a complete costing system on commercial lines for each and every one of the industries in the prisons, but we consider that, from time to time for short periods, detailed costings of particular industries at individual prisons should be fully prepared, in order that the Prison Authorities may be fully informed of the economic result of the work in the prisons, and in order that they may be helped in detecting weaknesses in the organization of prison industries. The work would best be done by detaching the supervising staff for cost accounting from the headquarters' accounting staff of the Prison Authorities where necessary, and using the clerical staffs of prisons for the detailed work. Some small addition to headquarters' staff may be needed.

We suggested to the Prison Commissioners a revision of the system of recording prisoners' work, and if a system on these lines is adopted, we think a more accurate record of work done will be available than at present exists. In any case experiments should be continued until a satisfactory form of record can be worked out. It is not our intention that the actual cash return from prison work shall govern the scales of prisoners' remuneration: the governing factor in fixing rates of pay should be efficiency in performing work allotted, but the record of work and the value of it will both be relevant factors to be taken into consideration in fixing scales. Until more accurate records are available we see no objection to the continuance of rates of payment on the lines of those at present in use at Wakefield.

210. We consider that the system of valuation of prisoners' work used in the annual reports of the Prison Commissioners must in any case be abandoned; it presents an altogether illusory idea of the nature and value of the work of the prisoners, and of the financial aspect of the problem the management has to face. So soon as returns are available showing the work done and the value to be placed on it in relation to the price obtained for goods, new tables showing the return for prison labour should be substituted. So far as possible goods made for prison use should be valued on the same basis as goods made for Government Departments.

211. Experience alone will show whether some of our recommendations are likely to prove satisfactory both from the point of view of the treatment of the prisoner and of the financial return obtained. Reorganization of the prison industries is needed, and, in proportion as the reorganization succeeds new orders must be obtained to fill increased capacity. The importance of real co-operation on the part of the purchasing departments to secure this result cannot be over-emphasized. For these reasons we do not contemplate the simultaneous application of our recommendations to all prisons, but recommend that in the first instance they should be applied experimentally to certain large establishments and that in their further action the Commissioners should be guided by the experience thus gained.

SUMMARY OF CONCLUSIONS.

212. We give below for convenience of reference a short summary of the principal points in our report. Such a summary is necessarily incomplete and reference should be made to the text at the paragraphs quoted for a full explanation of our proposals.

Our principal recommendations may be summarized as follows :—

(1) **The root of all evil in the employment of prisoners is the definite shortage of work. Occupation for prisoners is essential to their physical and moral needs. More work, preferably requiring no considerable skill in actual performance, must be obtained; it may with advantage be work which is physically hard** (Paras. 122, 128, 149).

(2) **Training in industry rather than production on an economic scale should be the primary consideration of employment in the case of:—**

(i) **Borstal inmates.**

(ii) **Prisoners under 30 years of age with comparatively long sentences.**

Delay in commencing training should be minimized (paras. 129, 196-198).

(3) **A definite policy regarding prison industries must be formulated and carried out, including a continuance of the policy of segregating suitable types of prisoners in selected prisons, and the allocation to those prisons of suitable industries** (paras. 151-153, 202).

(4) **The organization and lay-out of prison workshops should be overhauled and modernized** (paras. 150-152, 173, 174, 202).

(5) **The nominal 8-hour day of associated labour should be restored** (paras. 156-159).

(6) **Speed and efficiency of work in prison workshops must be improved in order to guard against deterioration of the physical and moral power of instructors and prisoners. More, and better qualified, instructors are needed. Industrial Managers should be appointed at the larger prisons. A system of payment to prisoners who reach a minimum output of adequate quality should be introduced. Rate fixing, both as regards quantitative output and rate of payment should be done scientifically. A measure of psychological training should be given to selected Borstal Housemasters** (paras. 130, 167, 169-172, 178-188, 200).

(7) **The machinery for seeking manufacturing orders from Government Departments, Local Authorities and other sources, and for the purchase of materials must be improved** (paras. 132-140).

(8) **More land work should be obtained, either cultural or land reclamation** (paras. 143-147).

(9) **An additional Commissioner should be appointed to the Prison Commission, England and Wales, charged specially with the duty of reorganizing and supervising prison industries in England and Wales. He should also act as adviser to the Scottish Prison Department** (paras. 189-193).

(10) **Governors should take a greater interest in industrial work** (para. 194).

(11) **Classification of prisoners should be left to the Prison Authorities** (para. 155).

(12) **The Courts should state clearly the conditions of Borstal sentences** (para. 195).

(13) **The basis on which the statements of the value of prisoners' labour are compiled should be revised** (Chapter V and para. 210).

These recommendations are applicable both to Prisons and to Borstal Institutions, except as regards 11 which does not relate to the Borstal system, and 12 which relates to Borstal only.

We have the honour to be,

Sir,

Your obedient Servants,

ISIDORE SALMON.

C. E. BARTHOLOMEW.

G. H. CLARK.

W. C. CROOK.

SARA MARGERY FRY..

ARTHUR HOLLINS.

J. J. MAXWELL.

JAMES SCOTT.

HAROLD SCOTT.

A. WATSON.

F. D. FORSTER,
Secretary.

APPENDIX I.

List of Witnesses Examined.

Mr. O. C. Allen, C.B.E.	Assistant Secretary, Ministry of Labour.
Mr. H. B. Allum, O.B.E.	Controller of Supplies, H.M. Office of Works.
Lieut.-Col. R. E. W. Baird, O.B.E.	Secretary, Prisons Department for Scotland.
Miss L. C. Barker, C.B.E., J.P. ...	Governor, H.M. Borstal Institution, Aylesbury.
Mr. F. C. Bovenschen, C.B.	Director of Army Contracts.
Mr. R. L. Bradley, M.C.	Governor, H.M. Borstal Institution, Borstal.
Capt. J. I. Buchan, D.S.O.	Governor, H.M. Prison, Peterhead.
Mr. Roy Calvert	representing the National Association of Prison Visitors. (Mr. Calvert also gave evidence on his own behalf).
Capt. G. F. Clayton	Governor, H.M. Prison, Parkhurst.
Miss C. M. Craven	representing the Howard League for Penal Reform.
Mr. D. Ashton Davies	representing the Howard League for Penal Reform.
Mr. A. T. A. Dobson, C.V.O., C.B.E.	Assistant Secretary, Ministry of Agriculture and Fisheries.
Dr. W. Norwood East	H.M. Commissioner of Prisons.
Mr. A. F. Ferguson, M.C.	representing the Scottish Central After-Care Council.
Capt. H. J. Fletcher, M.C.	representing the Royal Society for the Assistance of Discharged Prisoners.
Mr. R. M. Gould	Ministry of Labour.
Sir Wemyss Grant-Wilson	Director of the Borstal Association, and of the Central Association for the Aid of Discharged Convicts.
Mr. A. G. Herbert	Secretary, Forestry Commission.
Mr. N. R. Hilton	Governor, H.M. Prison, Wakefield.
Mr. B. E. Holloway, C.B.	Director of Contracts, Air Ministry.
Mr. W. St. D. Jenkins, C.B., C.B.E.	Director of Navy Contracts.
Commissioner David C. Lamb ...	representing the Salvation Army.
Mr. Mason	Prison Commission.
Mr. A. Maxwell, C.B.	Deputy Under-Secretary of State, Home Office.
Mr. A. Paterson, M.C.	H.M. Commissioner of Prisons.
The Rev. M. W. Pinker	Organizing Secretary, Manchester Prisoners' Aid Society.
Mr. A. Rodger	representing the National Institute of Industrial Psychology.
Lieut.-Col. H. S. Rogers, C.M.G., D.S.O.	Surveyor, H.M. Prison Commission.
Miss M. Size	Deputy Governor, H.M. Prison, Holloway.
Mr. D. S. Todd	Director of Printing and Binding, Stationery Office.
Mr. A. G. Tydeman	Vice-Controller, Post Office Stores Department.

Mr. W. F. Wackrill, O.B.E.	...	Ministry of Health.
Mr. F. P. Whitbread	Chairman, Central Discharged Prisoners' Aid Society.
Mr. W. Young	Governor, H.M. Prison, Manchester.

The following submitted memoranda, but were not called:—

Mr. W. H. Blackburn	Organizing Secretary, West Riding Prisoners' Aid Society.
Mr. W. E. Bunney	Visitor, H.M. Prison, Leicester.
Mr. S. W. Harris, C.B., C.V.O.	...	Assistant Under-Secretary of State, Home Office.
Mr. W. W. Llewellyn	Governor, H.M. Borstal Institution, Lowdham.
Mr. Malcolm MacNaughtan	...	Hon. Treasurer, Surrey and South London Prisoners' Aid Society.
Mr. E. G. Mawson	General Secretary, Federation of Prisoners' Aid Societies (North and Midland).

APPENDIX II.

SELECTIONS FROM STATEMENTS BY PRISONERS ON THE QUESTION OF EMPLOYMENT AND TRAINING IN PRISONS.

Statement by a Prisoner aged 40 (Cotton Broker) serving a sentence of five years Penal Servitude.

In putting forward the following suggestions one takes it for granted that they are to apply to those prisoners serving sentences of 12 months or more. It would be difficult to evolve any scheme which would meet the case of short sentence men as they are not in prison for a long enough period to benefit to any extent from a course of instruction in any trade. Further, any suggestions made or criticism offered are bound to be influenced largely by one's own experience and reactions to the situation.

After the initial keen feeling of the disgrace and the sense that one has become an outcast has merged into either a hopeless acceptance of the situation or a determination to make the best of a bad job and to work hard to fit one's self for a difficult fight on discharge, I think the long sentence prisoner feels most the futility of the daily round of prison tasks either as punishment or education.

One appreciates that the routine and discipline are necessary and beneficial, but the obvious difficulty of finding adequate employment for all prisoners and the consequent overcrowding of working parties, tends to encourage habits of laziness and shirking, which habits once formed are difficult to throw off and are the worst possible equipment for a prisoner on discharge.

Of course a number of prisoners are just wastrels who are unlikely ever to make good and no amount of training or consideration will improve them, but for the others, who comprise the majority of "Star" prisoners, opportunities to learn trades and really to fit themselves to earn a living would be most welcome.

In some cases a prisoner is definitely unable to return to his previous occupation and in others his knowledge and skill in his own trade are not up to the standard which would incline employers to overlook his prison record and to afford him an opportunity of rehabilitating himself.

The man in the one case has to learn an entirely new trade if he is to support himself on discharge and the man in the other case must either learn a new trade or so increase his skill in his own trade that an employer will be willing to give him a fresh chance.

If such prisoners are not afforded opportunities to fit themselves for life on discharge they are apt to drift either into a state of dejection, when they rather dread the day of release, or they incline to an embittered outlook on life and rather reckon that if they cannot obtain a living by honest methods outside they will endeavour to do so by dishonest ones.

If men can be interested and encouraged to learn useful trades they will certainly have more contented minds and be better behaved whilst in prison and, when they receive their freedom, they will be more likely to turn out useful citizens than before conviction and sentence.

The system now in operation at Wakefield suggests itself as a suitable basis on which to build up a Training Centre where prisoners could be taught trades suitable to their abilities and inclinations.

The scheme could well be an elaboration of the present system, i.e. a number of shops with skilled instructors in charge where useful and necessary work would be done and where at the same time prisoners would obtain the needful instruction and experience in the trades they were learning. There seems no reason why, under such a system, the prison should not be self supporting.

At present Wakefield Prison has a Weaving Shed, Rug Shop, Foundry, Twine Shed, Mat Shop and Tailors' Shop in addition to the smaller shops such as the Carpenters' and the Fitters' shops kept up for Prison Maintenance work and common to most Prisons.

There are large shops at other Prisons, such as the Printing Shop and Tin Shop at Maidstone etc., and, if these large shops were concentrated in one Centre and that Centre made responsible for the supply of maintenance materials and other articles both to the Prison Service and to other Government Offices and Services, the shops would furnish continual employment for a considerable number of prisoners. Further, under such conditions it should be practicable to instal up to date machinery and to place highly skilled tradesmen in charge.

Those in charge should not only have a thorough knowledge of their various trades but also have the ability to impart such knowledge to others and the gift of understanding the men they were handling.

Great care would be required in the allocation of prisoners to the various shops and a prisoner's inclinations, educational standard and previous experience would all have to be taken into account. It would be obvious waste of time to place an ex solicitor or a one time stock broker in the Weaving shed (unless of course he had a position in view where such knowledge would be useful) or an ex bricklayer's labourer in the Printing shop. The latter shop is more suited for the professional man and the Foundry, Weaving or one of the maintenance shops for the labourer.

Once a prisoner is posted to a shop it should be impressed upon him that he has the opportunity of learning a trade thoroughly and that it is up to him to make the most of his chance. He should realise that if he is lazy or otherwise misconducts himself he is liable to lose his place in the shop and be posted to a party doing the cleaning, scrubbing and general drudgery work of the Prison.

Every man posted to a shop for the purpose of learning a trade would undergo a course of intensive instruction in that particular trade, and the course should embrace both the practical and theoretical sides. A series of lectures by experts would be useful if it could be arranged, and possibly a portion of each working day could be devoted to theoretical instruction or, if this was not possible, then lectures in the evenings with practical demonstration in the shops when necessary.

A man after ten or twelve months say in the Weaving Shed should have a sound working knowledge of a Weaver's duties and also some knowledge of different qualities of wools and yarns and an appreciation of the reasons governing the various customs and practices in the Trade.

The work and instructions in all shops could be organised along the lines suggested above and I feel certain that the output would increase and the standard of work be raised.

If considered advisable at times, prisoners of proved ability might lecture on subjects in which they were acknowledged experts.

It would be an additional incentive if examinations were held periodically and certificates awarded to those who achieved a certain standard of proficiency in their particular trades. If, in addition, some employers could be persuaded to offer employment to those who did particularly well in the examinations it would further encourage men to put forward their best efforts.

One factor essential to the success of such a scheme would be the placing of really skilled tradesmen in charge of each shop and also the shops should be run on business lines approximating as nearly as possible to outside conditions as the regulations and rules of the Prison permit. It would also be essential that men should not be permitted to change from one shop to another because they had changed their minds or found the work did not suit them. Provided a man's qualifications and inclinations received full consideration before posting there should be no need for change except to a cleaning party.

Of trades suitable to combine instructions with necessary prison work I would suggest shoe-making and repairs, cookery, brickmaking, carpentry and joinery and painting and decorating. These in addition to the shops such as the weaving shed, foundry, tailors', twine and mats.

In all these trades, given qualified instructors and suitable opportunities and facilities for study, a man should be able after 12 months' hard work at least to earn a living for himself provided, of course, he can obtain an offer of employment. If a number of employers could be found who were willing to offer employment to men in possession of certificates of efficiency this difficulty would be overcome to a large extent.

The question of training for professional men, clerks, etc., who are not suited to any of the above mentioned trades is one of considerable difficulty and one can only suggest the establishment of correspondence courses or some other form of instruction in salesmanship, advertising, accountancy or other sedentary occupations. The same principles as to certificates of efficiency, etc., could apply.

Classes might also be held to teach automobile engineering and possibly other branches of engineering as well.

The chief points which one wishes to make are those of suitable and profitable employment during the time of imprisonment, instruction in some trade by highly qualified instructors and ample facilities for study and to obtain practical experience of that trade or occupation which the prisoner hopes to follow on his discharge.

Such conditions, together with the knowledge that by hard work he might obtain satisfactory employment when he was released, would encourage a man to pull himself together and to face the future in a very different spirit to that which obtains amongst many prisoners to-day.

On reading through the foregoing I find that I have omitted to mention one important point in connection with the man doing a sentence of penal servitude. I refer to the question of the ticket of leave. I feel strongly that this should be abolished for the first offender as it forms a link with the past which he is anxious to wash out, and moreover no matter how leniently it is treated by the Local Authorities to whom he has to report there is always the possibility of abuse.

Statement by a prisoner aged 39 (motor engineer) serving a sentence of 12 months' imprisonment.

I understand that the question is "How can a man best be trained while in prison so that he may become a useful citizen when he leaves prison?"

(1) The question of training all men who get into prison is, in my opinion, impracticable, there are certain types of men who have no ambition and who could never be made into anything but labourers, so I propose to leave out these men and deal with the young men, of from 20 to 25 years old, who have not settled to any particular trade and to deal with older men who may wish to be perfected in the trade they have chosen.

(2) The time of day for the training is important, I would suggest that the training should be given during the day from 8 a.m. to 12 noon and from 1.30 p.m. to 5 p.m., since the above hours are hours in which he would normally be employed on some productive work. The training would supplant this productive work. Evening training is, in my opinion, not very welcome to a man after he has done a day's work, but the evenings could be used to deliver lectures on the various trades chosen.

(3) The choice of a trade by a man should be very carefully made, the man should be told he would be required to choose a trade and a small book could be delivered to him, setting out in detail the various trades taught at the Centre, and after advice had been given him by a small Board or by the gentlemen in charge of the training his decision could be arrived at in about a week.

This very great difficulty would, of course, not occur in the case of men who had already chosen a trade.

(4) The Training Centre could be equipped with separate shops for each trade, electrical, mechanical, motor engineering, plumbing, blacksmithing, tailoring, building, joinery and carpentry, cabinet making and french polishing, tinplate working and panel beating, etc. Each shop to be in charge of a competent instructor.

It would not, of course, be possible to finish the training in some of the trades, trades that take men years to learn, but quite a lot of useful knowledge would be imparted in such a way.

Clerical training could be imparted in day time classes by studying along definite lines with the object of taking an examination at the end of it.

(5) Evening classes could be arranged to deal with the theory of many of the above subjects, without which a man could not become proficient.

(6) The whole subject of training is involved in the man's willingness to learn, because a man cannot be trained if he is not willing to acquire the knowledge.

Statement by a prisoner aged 34 (weaver) serving a sentence of nine months' imprisonment.

For the purpose of simplicity I propose to divide prisoners into four categories:—

(a) Prisoners regularly in employment up to the time of arrest and having work to return to on discharge or a reasonable chance of obtaining same.

(b) Prisoners unemployed at time of arrest but having reasonable prospects of obtaining work on discharge.

(c) Prisoners regularly employed up to the time of arrest but without reasonable chance of obtaining similar work on discharge.

(d) Prisoners unemployed at the time of arrest and whose prospects of finding work in trades for which they may be fitted are doubtful on discharge.

Object.

Employment of prisoners whilst in custody to be of such a nature that prisoners in categories "a" and "b" will be at least no less fit for work on discharge than on reception and, as far as is practicable, prisoners to be afforded means by which their efficiency may be increased during their time in custody. Employment of prisoners in categories "c" and "d" to be of such a character that their prospects of finding work on discharge will not be worsened, but, on the contrary, as far as is practicable will be improved.

Questions.

How far is the present system of employment of prisoners succeeding in the above object? In what way could it be improved with this object in view?

In approaching these questions I find my only data is my personal experience of one month at Armley Jail, Leeds, and five months at Wakefield Jail.

Personally, as a prisoner, I fall under category "b." I am a cotton weaver by trade, but owing to unemployment and temporary work as a shuttle maker's agent I had on reception lost some of my skill as a weaver. During my employment at Wakefield in the "Power Looms" party I have not only regained some of my old skill, but have extended my experience in the weaving of linen and woollen goods and have acquired a fair amount of skill at the useful trade of "twisting in". I am thus partly trained for an alternate occupation in the same industry.

I cannot say that any of the work I did at Leeds (darning mail bags and partly making hammocks) increased or even maintained my efficiency at my normal occupation, nor can I see how it improved my prospects of obtaining work on discharge *in any way*. The same applies to my employment in the evening at Wakefield sewing mail bags by hand. Although the work is not heavy, laborious or degrading, there is in it an element of futility which can have a demoralising effect, I feel that I could occupy my time more profitably. I believe that mail bags could be made quite satisfactorily by machinery, and therefore our labour to some extent is like digging holes and filling them up. My employment in custody has not as a whole rendered me less fit for my normal work on discharge. It has in my case made me slightly fitter, but I respectfully beg to submit the following suggestions for improving the system of employment whilst in custody. I propose now to speak in a general way basing my opinion on my own experience and observations.

1. That mail bags and all articles which can be made by machinery should be manufactured in this way.
 2. That prisoners in all the four categories I have mentioned should be employed as far as is practicable in legitimate occupations likely to be followed by them after discharge. All prisoners should be interviewed personally soon after reception and advice and guidance given (especially in those in categories "c" and "d"). Closer touch maintained in this with the Discharged Prisoners' Aid Society.
 3. That a certain stage be introduced in imprisonment where the prisoners are employed at full Trade Union rates of pay in the manufacture of commodities of articles for sale on the open market. (This would provide an outlet for the products and enable the prison authorities to vary and increase the number of possible occupations in custody. Furthermore it would narrow the gulf between the life of the prisoner and normal social life outside and increase his capacity on discharge to adapt himself to normal social life.)
- Out of the wages paid a deduction to be made for the cost of maintenance of the prisoners in custody.

4. Greater variety and number of technical and cultural classes, the classes to be of sufficient duration each time when held to permit the student to thoroughly apply himself to his subject.

5. Utilisation, where possible, of prisoners as tutors in the above classes, under suitable control of course.

6. The training of all officers to give helpful and sympathetic instruction to prisoners at work in addition to maintaining discipline.

7. More facilities for self-education and creative work whilst in custody, i.e., permission granted in proper cases to prisoners to compose literary works or scientific research in so far as this would not seriously increase the difficulty of maintaining secure custody of the prisoner.

In conclusion I would only suggest that the initial costs of introducing constructive changes should be quickly balanced by a saving in the costs of crime detection, criminal legal proceedings and the non-productive prison administration and upkeep.

Statement by a prisoner aged 46 (ex-solicitor), serving a sentence of three years penal servitude.

May I express how deeply I appreciate the honour you have conferred upon others and myself in asking us to express our views as prisoners on the subject of prison life and conditions in their relation to the grave problem of our future on discharge.

Only those who know the generous, broadminded and enlightened policy you pursue at this prison would credit the creation of such a precedent. The invitation itself and its indication of "trust" in the men under you not only speaks of the very high regard in which you are held, but also points the reason for it—that you put your men on their "trust and honour" and give them a "square deal" both in policy and administration.

The spirit underlying the Wakefield system as I understand it is to develop a public school spirit in its highest sense with in many respects the poorest of material. That, though seemingly quixotic, is the true starting point, but the starting point only.

As a convict, I naturally speak most intimately from a convict's point of view which differs somewhat from that of a "local" prisoner. First in importance I would suggest in dealing with prisoners is the matter of classification. The right or wrong classification of men largely determines their course on discharge because upon it rests not only the environment in which they move, but often the future associations they form and the trend of their future thought and action.

The "Star" prisoners at Wakefield could I think be roughly divided into three groups. "A" men who amount to about 30 per cent. who will not unless something extraordinary happens see prison again. "C" men who either from heredity, choice, training or association will always be criminals no matter what is done for them. The remainder "B" halt between two opinions. They are the men who really matter for it depends on the treatment they receive and the influences brought to bear upon them and the associations they form whether they "make good" or not. Such men should in my opinion without contact with other prisoners be drafted direct to a reception wing of a "Star" prison where, whilst not coming into contact with accepted "Star" men, they could be observed by specially selected experienced officers, preferably not of a stern nature, but capable of showing "the iron hand beneath the velvet glove," who could learn from their conversation, habits and deportment into what category they should be placed, i.e., "A" good, "B" amenable to good influence and "C" bad.

In this work officers could be given incalculable assistance by picked prisoners of whom there are a number in category "A" who are just as anxious to assist their fellows as to achieve their own salvation.

After classification "C" men should be sent to a prison where, again kept apart from Recidivists," they would be subject to kind but firm treatment on the understanding that if they should promise of mending their ways they could by merit obtain a transfer to a "Star" prison.

The prison for "B" men should be the same as for "A" men and control (subject to supervision) should be largely in the hands of "A" men. The mess system is an excellent starting point in this respect, but the greatest care should be taken in the selection of mess presidents (or strokes). The idea of a strokes' committee gives a plan whereby the Governor could utilise the ideas and observations of strokes (or picked "A" men). I cannot emphasise too strongly that the greatest firmness should be shown as regards obscene language. A special type of officer should be used in staffing such prisons. The old type of disciplinarian is a mistake. "Star" officers should be the reverse of "soft," but should be widely read, good at sport, not necessarily as players, essentially Christian men in the true sense of the word, and in the case of those dealing with young offenders men who have had a military or naval training.

The next consideration is employment. In my opinion there is not a single trade at Wakefield that does more for a man than help him to "kill" time. I do not say this or intend it in any sense in a derogatory manner. There is simply not the scope for anything more in the materials at hand. For instance, "gardens" without plenty of glass to teach "intensive culture" are unthinkable. Not a single choice bloom can be produced and overworked land cannot produce even economical crops. The remedy for the latter seems in outside parties which in a small way has been tried. The production of supplies of out-of-season flowers and vegetables, always a fruitful profitable and happy hunting ground for gardeners, would hurt no outside commercial interests as the producer of such commodities is almost wholly in the hands of foreign countries. The "power loom" is by reason of its antiquity unable to produce weavers capable of taking their place in industry and, even if it could, careful "after-care" methods would be necessary for the men so trained. Joiners, shoe repairers and makers, painters, engineers, etc., are by the limitation of their scope almost solely "maintenance" parties, but with more facilities at the command of the authority governing the institution be made training units. Mail bag sewing is perhaps the worst of all, for it is unpopular with the men, and with an "unclassified" body of men lends itself to untold mischief by the mass conversation. Every stroke can usually trace trouble in his mess to some sedition monger holding forth on "mail bags" association.

The system of classes, whilst excellent in its ideals and working, is largely pointless. It is too often merely a subterfuge for dodging "mail bags" and to short-sentence men it has no chance of doing good. In my view the only men who can be really helped by a prison reform system are long-sentence men. Short-sentence men should be used for cook-house, cleaning, laundry and maintenance duties and their spare time given to a definite system of classes in useful subjects. Their time of separation from normal life does not disturb so much the tenor of their way. The classes I would suggest are those which would create a good hobby or create a real new interest which would continue to interest and employ their leisure time in the outside world. Such subjects are practical mechanics, carving, painting, wireless construction, leather work, shoe repairs, music, and so forth, even fretwork would be useful together with such useful classes as are now in vogue, like "first aid" and "Play reading," etc., which stimulate an intelligent interest in good literature.

The treatment of long-sentence men should be partly study and partly work, but both in relation to each other and both of the highest technical character obtainable and designed to produce a really efficient workman. Joinery, shoemaking, tailoring, engineering, foundry work, even mats, should be pursued in the training in such a way as to produce a man capable of producing an article that could stand an even chance in a competitive market. Technical training in the morning should be followed by practical work in the afternoon and vice versa, so that the work would be always running and thus be self-supporting from an economic point of view, and the industry be always on full time. The enhanced value of the article should repay any extra cost of up-to-date machinery. The evenings could be utilised for private study with occasional evenings at recreation or other forms of labour to vary the monotony.

Examinations should be held such as are set at technical colleges or the City and Guilds examinations and proficiency in an industrial subject should be an "open sesame" to some increased remission or system of parole. Such parole should permit work at a remunerative wage as a "dilutee" in some Government factories, dockyards or Ordnance stores (not of course in the "explosive section") where men could reaccustom themselves to freedom again. Men who require money to reconstruct their home should be eligible for loans or grants repayable out of their wages. Payment of prison wages should be the rule and on a generous scale which would allow to deserving men not only simple luxuries and a change of food, but also a small allowance to their families, if necessary, a compulsory allotment, and an opportunity of saving against their discharge so that they would in no circumstances leave the prison penniless or nearly so. Money might be allowed to be sent in to the more fortunately placed prisoners on the understanding that it would go to a common fund, out of which the recipient would receive a portion and his fellow prisoners (less fortunate) a portion also. This I know would create a good fellowship among men without any attendant ills. All payments should be on a flat rate and incentive to production and industry maintained by reduction or suspension of the wage to the undeserving man.

"After care" work is of great importance. Many men when "up against it" will continue to bravely struggle especially with a little help if assured of a kind but not too interfering Society to whom he can appeal and which concerns itself for him.

The foregoing relates more especially to young men.

The older men especially of the professional class remain alike the saddest and the most tragic problem.

The Printing Shop at Maidstone came nearest to solving the problem of my, as also of my brother professional men's difficulties. I had charge for nearly 11 months of a printing machine and became a fairly proficient operator as did others in book binding, ruling, compositing, stereo-typing, etc. Here again however the higher branches of the Printing trade were not taught which might make men useful at least as individuals in a jobbing Printer's business. Had such training been given (on parole) to men admitted to work in H.M. Stationery Office until something turned up or a place found for them, great good could have been done. Training to be of use can only be given by experienced and fully qualified men. All branches of a trade necessary for a good workman should be taught. For example at Maidstone only one colour printing was in use whereas two or more colour work is necessary and could be taught even with the present equipment of the shop. The stereo room was occupied by one man only and was used solely for turning out the necessary plates to carry out orders. No attempt, such as might have been made, was made to train other men, even to provide against the contingency of illness or discharge of the sole operator. Other branches of work for individuals could also be taught.

The suggestion may seem at first amusing and even frivolous, but shops for the sale of refreshments are a possible means of livelihood. An instance will perhaps make my meaning clear. A man whom I had defended approached me after receiving a short sentence in a prison (where he had been employed mainly in the cookhouse) as to any suggestion I could offer him as to his future. He had £20 in his possession. I did not enquire very closely as to how he had obtained it, but I knew he meant to go straight. I asked him if he knew anything of cooking and found he had turned his experience in the prison cookhouse to a useful purpose. I was winding up a small estate at the time part of which consisted of a moribund fish and chip shop on a main road in a dense industrial area. I advised him to take it and suggested that he should make meat pies, puddings, stews, etc., and bruit it well abroad that cheap dinners could be had daily. To cut a long story short—it took on. Women saved themselves the trouble and expense of fires and cooking both for their children and their men by buying his dinners and in twelve months his £20 had another nought at the end after paying all expenses. He then took a shop at a small sea resort where for a shilling he provided a slice of roast cod, bread and butter, sauce and a mineral water. One dish only. The idea caught on and his shop was crowded nightly during the season with people coming from concerts who could not get a hot meal at their lodging. He later bought a motor van equipped with a stove and delivered orders to people at their lodgings to save them the trouble of standing in a queue at his shop. I do not know how he stands now, but the last I heard was that he had three such shops and used an expensive car to visit them, and he does no cooking himself but employs other ex-prisoners to help him, I believe two years ago he had no less than fifteen. I do not suggest that all ex-prisoners could start fish and chip shops but there are other ideas where with a small capital advanced with some security as for instance the goodwill of the shop in this case, where with a small but practical prison training a man could recover his balance.

The final stage is the equipment of the man mentally and financially for his emergence into society.

The last point I desire to make is the provision of means to equip a man's mentality for life in the world again.

Prison life with its ordered routine and self-repression through discipline saps a man's self confidence, creates a fear of responsibility, causes mental cowardice and adversely affects the memory. I speak from experience and necessarily feelingly. Wakefield has done much to restore what Maidstone took away but it is still there. In "lifers" it is most marked for they become after a number of years like children again—devoid of all initiative, without hope or ambition—counting the months or years towards—nothing. "Infants crying in the night, infants crying for the light and with no language but a cry". This problem is a difficult one. It involves the question of discipline on the one hand and the prisoner's welfare on the other. The Wakefield system carefully extended and picked and reliable men and augmented could do much to remedy this most alarming trait. I have not been on a public street without an officer or in a public place for two years to-day. I believe I should feel terror at crossing a busy street, and should instinctively look for an officer to apprehend me. I have also lost touch with public affairs. This "inferiority complex" is largely responsible for disorder in prison and for offences against prison regulations. To remedy this I would suggest that in the later stages of a man's time properly selected men should be allowed wireless sets (of the headpiece type of course) to enable them to establish touch with the world's news and doings. Occasional visits to trusted men should be permitted either upon trust or honour or accompanied by an officer to a church, theatre or town, and greater freedom from restraint be given within the

walls of the prison itself. This would be an incentive and reward for men in earlier stages to look forward to, and "behave for" and would create a body of select men who would have a tremendous influence in preserving their amenities by controlling the actions of other prisoners both by precept and example.

May I close by saying very sincerely that my stay in Wakefield is really a happy one. It is a shelter of peace before the coming storm which I have to meet next year and I am deeply grateful for all it has done, and it is much—to win back my self respect and hope.



**THIS BOOK MUST NOT
BE REMOVED
FROM THE LIBRARY**

LF24





Report of the Departmental Committee on the Employment of Prisoners

PART I EMPLOYMENT OF PRISONERS

*Presented by the Secretary of State for Home Affairs
to Parliament by Command of His Majesty,
November, 1933*

LONDON

PRINTED AND PUBLISHED BY HIS MAJESTY'S STATIONERY OFFICE

To be purchased directly from H.M. STATIONERY OFFICE at the following addresses
Adastral House, Kingsway, London, W.C.2; 120, George Street, Edinburgh 2
York Street, Manchester 1; 1, St. Andrew's Crescent, Cardiff
15, Donegall Square West, Belfast
or through any Bookseller

1933

Price 1s. 6d. Net

Cmd. 4462